
Annex 1

Consultation on Draft Supplementary Planning Document, December 2010-February 2011

Former British Sugar and Manor School site, Boroughbridge Rd, York

Summary of Comments on Consultation Draft, March 2012



**Former British Sugar/ Manor School Draft Supplementary Planning Document
Summary of Comments on Consultation Draft**

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
General Comments					
A1	Look at other developments and copy what works	21	63	Best practice in other relevant developments has been taken into account in the draft SPD and will continue to be considered in the emerging work.	No Change
A2	Agree in general with all 10 principles	47	133	Noted	No Change
		196	754		
		197	757		
		205	791		
		206	793		
		210	819		
		212	834		
		215	852		
		216	857		
		217	862		
		218	867		
		219	874		
		220	877		
		223	884		
		132	581		
A3	Disagree with all 10 principles	195	750	Noted	No Change
		199	764		
		202	780		
		207	801		
		211	827		
		214	846		
A4	Support the approach outlined	52	150	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A5	Support principles but concerned about their deliverability	58	165	Principles have been developed to form the context for emerging masterplanning proposals. Deliverability will be a key issue in developing any proposals and will be established in subsequent stages of work.	No Change
		109	367		
		95	293		
		117	494		
A6	Principles are poorly worded	117	494	The SPD is a technical document, which will guide the development of the site as well as forming the basis for public consultation. It is therefore important to ensure the Principles are broad to cover the more specific areas outlined in the associated Statements.	No Change
		199	765		
		195	751		
A7	Principles require quantifiable standards/ requirements	117	495	The outcomes of principles and statements cannot be quantified at this stage in advance of detailed masterplanning, and are therefore target based. Where appropriate, indicative quantified requirements are set out in the draft SPD as worked examples	No Change
A8	Principles are contradictory eg Affordable housing and expensive green cars	156	699	Principles do not directly contradict one another, however, the draft SPD should be read as a whole, and the degree to which each principle is met will need to be balanced in subsequent stages of work	No Change
A9	Principles are relatively generic and could relate to any new development	218	868	The principles outlined are high-level, but have been developed in response to detailed examination of site specific issues, with more detailed and site-specific guidance given in the statements.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A10	SPD needs to capture the benefits of the natural environment through land use and ecosystem services	65	205	A holistic approach to living within environmental limits and ensuring resources are used effectively will be promoted throughout the design of the development. Principle 4 seeks to achieve the highest achievable standards of sustainability in the development, whilst having regard to deliverability. Reference to offsetting the impact of the development on the natural environment could be made in para 6.2.	Amend para 6.2
A11	Request a champion natural environment group is given the opportunity to review the SPD given that a ROWIP, Tree Strategy and Green Infrastructure SPD is not in place and Renewable Energy work is not complete	65	207	The draft SPD was subject to public consultation between December 2010 and February 2011. There will be further opportunities for inputting to the planning process through masterplan and planning application consultation. The comments regarding input on these issues by a champion natural environment group will be noted in further stages of the planning process.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A12	Question whether the content of the SPD will lead to the development envisaged	77	235	The SPD will form the high level framework against which subsequent stages of work will be assessed, and more detailed proposals will be developed.	No Change
A13	A good example of development at Fairfield Park, Arlesey, Bedfordshire (Mid Beds Council) used a design guide and should be reviewed	78	240	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A14	Commercial or industrial development would serve the existing community, disagree with the approach planned	82	253	Yorks draft Core Strategy assessed potential housing and employment sites throughout York, and was informed by evidence base including the Employment Land Review stage 2, and the Strategic Housing Land Availability Assessment. The Core Strategy recommends that the former British Sugar and Manor School site is taken forward as a strategic allocation to meet housing needs. Notwithstanding this, Statement 6 of the draft SPD promotes small scale office development to meet local needs, and live/ work opportunities.	No Change
A15	Should also consider retention of old Manor School buildings	87	273	These buildings have been considered unsuitable for continued use as a school and whilst there is currently temporary occupation of the buildings, the occupier only uses a small proportion of the premises available. The temporary use of the buildings is mainly to keep the site secure in the short term. Re-use of the buildings would require substantial investment and be uneconomic to secure.	No Change
A16	National Grid policy is for the retention of existing overhead powerlines in the site - development will need to take account of the location/ nature of this equipment and statutory clearances required	88	274	This issue will be taken into account in subsequent stages of work.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A17	Support for the approach outlined as this will help to support the ongoing economic development within the city	91	280	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A18	Document should make reference to completed or imminent evidence base work in support of policy approaches where appropriate	115	413	Agree, will amend the text to refer to evidence work which has been produced since initial drafting. To include reference to Local Carbon Framework Study and contamination study work.	Amend paras 2.6 and 3.5 to include additional evidence base work (see A 37 below)
A19	SPD should favour standards/ guidance as opposed to quantified requirements where these cannot be established in advance of the masterplan (eg open space which relates to quantum of housing). Requirements should emerge through a design led approach in the masterplan	115	414	The draft SPD does set out requirements based on standards, which allows a design led approach to interpreting these standards. In instances where an applied requirement is cited, these are clearly referenced as indicative or illustrative (p5.29-5.30 education, p5.33 built sports).	No Change
A20	Rural areas being eroded by housing/industry and park and ride sites	140	643	The draft Core Strategy considers the spatial development strategy for the city. The former British Sugar/ Manor School site has been identified as a residential led development site within this document.	No Change
A21	The heading 'You told us' is inappropriate and suggest 'The results of the public consultation exercise'.	135	622	The format of referencing to previous public consultation replicates the approach taken in the Core Strategy.	No Change
A22	Immediate site infrastructure must be comprehensively available from the beginning, including public transport provision.	135	613	The approach to phasing development, community facilities and enabling infrastructure is outlined at paragraphs 8.5- 8.10 of the draft SPD. Additional reference for renewable energy systems to be included at the beginning of the planning process could also be added.	Amend para 8.7 to refer to renewable energy systems to be provided from the beginning of the planning process.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A23	The principles are good but development will lead to hardship and inconvenience to the existing community.	134	585	Issues such as traffic impact and construction disturbance will be assessed as part of the planning application process, and measures to minimise these will be taken. The draft SPD recommends that a project management team approach is taken, to ensure integration and involvement of the existing community.	No Change
A24	Need to consider wider development taking place within the area and their impact collectively on, appearance of A59, setting of York, separation of villages, important narrow area of Green Belt in this location.	123	550	The development has been considered as part of the wider York Northwest Corridor and the spatial strategy to new development within the city, as outlined in the draft Core Strategy.	No Change
A25	Residents of Newlands Drive should have been consulted on the SPD	163	716	Future consultation as part of subsequent stages of work will consider a broader consultation boundary.	To note for future consultation.
A26	Northern Gas Networks has a medium pressure supply main in Boroughbridge Road and Milfield Lane. This main has sufficient capacity to supply the proposed development	204	790	Noted, NGN will continue to be consulted in subsequent stages of work.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
Format of document					
A27	Figure 11 needs to include Leeds City Region Green Infrastructure Strategy	64	196	Noted	Amend Figure 11 to include reference
A28	There is duplication in the principles	70	220	The document is structured to allow easy reference within the three themes, with principles providing a high level structure for more detailed policy statements.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A29	The structure and layout of the document should be revised to ensure key information is easily located, eg by improving the balance between text and graphics and more of the statistics presented in diagrams rather than text.	91	285	Key information such as the principles and statements are identified using different formatting . Further referencing by topic area could be made. Graphics are used where appropriate and relevant to the text of this technical document. Where references to statistics have been made this is to provide the context to the issue being highlighted and to give direction to the appropriate provision being sought.	Amend document to refer to relevant topic areas.
A30	The principles are very general	95	293	The document is structured to allow easy reference within the three themes, with principles providing a high level structure for more detailed policy statements.	No Change
		109	368		
A31	Principles are not clearly worded and objectives are not sufficiently detailed	51	146	A balanced approach is taken in the draft SPD between outlining the context for development whilst also allowing for flexibility in interpretation and delivery. It is therefore important to ensure the Principles are broad to cover the more specific areas outlined in the associated Statements.	No Change
A32	Recommend insertion of sub headings in text of document to following topics listed in contents	115	412	Noted	Amend document to refer to relevant topic areas.
Introduction					
A33	The relative weight between the Core Strategy and other LDF documents and the SPD and the policies within each document should be explained	75	227	The context of the draft Core Strategy is referred to within para 1.2 and 3.1-3.2 with the emerging policies for this site outlined within figure 6. The References are made to other LDF documents within Figure 4. It is not however appropriate to duplicate policies in other documents.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
Context					
A34	Site needs to be timed to co-ordinate with York Central	17	49	It is unlikely that the programme for developing York Central will co-incide with this site. The strategic planning considerations relevant to the York Northwest area will be addressed through the Core Strategy and associated documents.	No Change
A35	Use site as nature reserve in the short term in order to align the development with York Central	104	334	Whilst open space will be provided as part of the development, use of the entire site for such purposes would not be commercially viable or make best use of this brownfield site. There will be benefits in ensuring that housing is delivered in the short, medium and long term on these strategic sites and it is important to ensure the housing is introduced into the market in a phased way.	No Change
A36	Important to integrate with York Central site to enable residents to benefit from cultural, recreational and economic opportunities.	91	283	Integration with York Central is provided for by establishing the planning context of the York Northwest Corridor in both the emerging Core Strategy and draft SPD.	No Change
		29	93		
A37	Reference to contamination should acknowledge that studies have been carried out and indicate how this issue will be dealt with	115	415	Many possible sources of land contamination have been identified at the site, including the landfill site, fuel tanks, ash pits, settlement ponds, storage areas and buildings. Since 2006, the developer has undertaken a number of ground investigations at the site. Remedial work is required to clean up the contamination, to ensure that the site is safe and suitable for its future use. A remediation strategy, outlining the proposed remedial work, must be submitted to and agreed by the City of York Council's environmental protection unit prior to carrying out the remediation work.	Amend para 2.6 to include reference to investigative work which has been carried out. Amend Fig 19 to include reference to the need for a Remediation Strategy to be submitted and agreed by the council.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A38	The site still has several waste licences from its previous operations which must be surrendered if they are no longer needed.	132	580	Noted.	No Change
A39	Recommend wording is simplified	115	416	The SPD is a technical document, which will guide the development of the site as well as forming the basis for public consultation.	No Change
Policy Framework					
A40	Section 180 of the Town and Country Planning Act 2008 removed the requirement for Sustainability appraisals on SPD's. Reasons why a SA is necessary for this SPD needs explanation.	75	228	Most topic based SPDs for example a Shop Front Design Guide are unlikely to require a SA as they are unlikely to have significant environmental effects. However, in this case it is an area-based SPD which may have significant environmental effects and the guidance suggests that in most area based SPD's these effects are unlikely to have been appraised adequately in the higher level planning document - i.e. the Core Strategy.	No Change - the Core Strategy SA will not adequately appraise the British Sugar Site in enough detail to meet the requirements of the SEA Directive.
A41	The site could include a waste facility which could provide sustainable energy due to the contaminated land, brownfield site and direct access from A1237	94	292	The strategy for the future allocation of sites for waste management is outlined within the emerging Core Strategy at a strategic level. This site is identified for housing and not as a waste management site. The approach to waste arising from the development will be covered in the Environmental Statement. A sustainable approach to waste management will be encouraged.	No Change
A42	Reference to British Sugar SPD excludes Manor School site	119	510	This is a typing error and will be amended.	Amend the reference to the SPD in Figure 4

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A43	The localism agenda should be reflected in this diagram, with illustration of a "bottom-up" approach	115	417	Figure 5 could be deleted as reference to other plans, strategies and documents is made elsewhere in the document.	Delete Figure 5 and refer to Key Influences sections within Themes.
A44	Welcome proposal to seek to deliver Eco-town principles in brownfield location, but lack of clarity about how these will be adapted	114	407	Noted	No Change
A45	Policy context should include reference to RSS, which is still a material consideration	114	411	The Localism Bill 2011 has received Royal Assent and pending legal challenge, the RSS is intended to be revoked. The final draft will address this issue.	No Change
A46	Support flexible approach to housing numbers	115	418	Noted	No Change
A47	Concerned that quantum of housing has been overestimated given amount of ancillary infrastructure and facilities set out.	119	511	The Strategic Housing Land Availability Assessment (SHLAA) methodology has been used to calculate the housing potential of the site. This is consistent with the approach taken to calculate the housing potential of other development sites in York. A gross to net ratio has been applied to the site of 70/30 which means that 30% of the gross site area has been set aside for infrastructure, on site facilities and open space. A density of 47 dph has been applied to the remaining 70% to calculate the housing potential.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A48	Concerned that SPD is progressing in advance of Core Strategy and York Northwest Area Action Plan	119	508	The York Northwest AAP is not being progressed and the planning framework for these sites will be set out in the emerging Core Strategy and SPD's. Formal adoption of the SPD will follow adoption of the Core Strategy with the draft SPD used for development control purposes in the interim following agreement by Members. If issues emerge from the Core Strategy which affect the SPD this will be taken into account before it is adopted.	No Change
Vision/Objectives					
A49	Needs to articulate more clearly the strategic role of this strategic site to support the economic future of York. Quality of place principles from the York Economic Masterplan should be outlined and used to underpin the vision for the site and stronger diagrams to better articulate the proposed vision.	91	281	The strategic role of the site within the city is set out in Section 6 of the emerging Core Strategy as part of the York Northwest corridor in meeting future economic prosperity and housing needs in the city. Quality of life principles are outlined in Theme 2 of the draft SPD. Para 2.12 could be amended to refer to the Core Strategy and vision and para 4.6 and Figure 11 to refer to York New City Beautiful. The vision diagram in Figure 8 in the Draft SPD highlights the key aspirations for York Northwest. More illustrative work for this is likely to be prepared as a result of the masterplanning work.	Amend para 2.12 to refer to the core strategy and wider vision for the city and 4.6 to refer to the York New City Beautiful. Amend Figure 11 to refer to York New City Beautiful: Toward an Economic Vision

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A50	SPD needs to be measured against SCS refresh, new York City Beautiful masterplan and City of York Climate Change Strategy	65	204	A draft City Plan is currently being prepared as the delivery plan for the Sustainable Community Strategy (SCS). This will be the subject of consultation and will inform the refresh of the SCS to be undertaken. At this stage therefore the SCS is an emerging document and has yet to be revised. Any relevant changes to this strategy will need to be taken into account as the planning process proceeds. Para 4.6 and Figure 11 of the draft SPD could be amended to make reference to York New City Beautiful: Toward an Economic Vision and the Climate Change Framework and Action Plan. The Climate Change Framework is identified as a key influence and opportunities to ensure the development adapts and responds to climate change are integral to the sustainable approach to development promoted in the draft SPD.	Amend para 4.6 to refer to the York New City Beautiful. Amend Figure 11 to refer to York New City Beautiful: Toward an Economic Vision and Climate Change Framework and Action Plan.
A51	Comparative figure for the scale of the city in comparison with other city sites should be given.	135	593	To amend to give comparative context of the scale of the site compared to other development sites within the city.	Amend para 4.1 to include reference to scale of the site compared to other sites.
A52	The description of residential led implies typical speculative housing development. The site must be developed as an organic extension to the city, with its own name distinctive identity, community facilities and local workspaces, reflecting new city beautiful aspirations of a new 21st century neighbourhood.	135	592	A strategic objective for the site is to ensure that the new community is fully integrated with existing communities. Principle 5 also outlines the aim of creating a high quality locally distinctive place which relates well to the surrounding area. Elements within the York New City Beautiful: Toward an Economic Vision for a new 21st century neighbourhood will be considered within subsequent planning work subject to deliverability.	Amend para 4.6 to refer to York New City Beautiful- Toward an Economic Vision.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A53	Figure 7 should make reference to open space/significant planting and a reduced carbon footprint being key components of the vision.	135	594	The vision is a high level statement which refers to quality of place and sustainable design. Open space/planting and the need to reduce the carbon footprint are included within the principles and statements within Theme 2: Quality Place/Environment.	No Change
A54	The SPD does not emphasise the mission statement of achieving 2020/2050 targets for reducing carbon emissions and the city's ecological footprint (outlined in York's Sustainable Community Strategy).	135	591	Text could be amended to make reference to the Climate Change Framework and the Sustainable Community Strategy in Principle 4.	Amend para 6.2
Theme 1: Sustainable, Interactive and Inclusive Communities					
A55	Figure 9 should be amended to make reference to the emerging updated SHMA	115	419	Statement 2 and para 5.13 refers to the most current evidence base being used at the point of negotiation on housing. The SHMA, 2011 is now available and Figure 9 should be updated to include this.	Amend para 5.13 and Figure 9 to make reference to the SHMA, 2011.
Principle 1: To create a sustainable balanced community through provision of an appropriate range of housing					
A56	There is no current need for speculative house building in York	98	305	Government guidance requires local authorities to identify land supply for housing through the identification of sites over a plan period.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A57	Northern part of the site should be used for industrial purposes.	128	564	The draft Core Strategy assessed potential housing and employment sites throughout York, and was informed by evidence base including the Employment Land Review stage 2, and the Strategic Housing Land Availability Assessment. The draft Core Strategy recommends that the former British Sugar and Manor School site is taken forward as a strategic allocation to meet housing needs. Notwithstanding this, Statement 6 of the draft SPD promotes small scale office development to meet local needs, and live/ work opportunities.	No Change
A58	Agree with principle	63	176	Noted	No Change
A59	Care must be taken in locating affordable housing as full integration has not worked elsewhere	69	217	Integration of affordable with market housing is sought in Draft Policy CS10 in the emerging Core Strategy. The pepper-potting of affordable housing is a key facet of City of York Council's affordable housing policy and strategic aims to create mixed balance communities. Affordable housing has been successfully integrated on a number of mixed tenure developments across the city.	No Change
A60	Support provision of good quality family housing	11	20	Noted	No Change
A61	The SHMA was published before the latest guidance by the CLG. The evidence base has therefore not been prepared in accordance with government guidance.	119	509	A North Yorkshire Strategic Housing Market Assessment has been prepared and the text in this theme area has been updated to take account in this latest guidance.	Amend paras 5.5,5.6,5.8-18 to reflect the revised SHMA.
A62	The Council should update its SHLAA to provide a credible evidence base	119	512	A North Yorkshire Strategic Housing Market Assessment has been prepared and the text in this theme area has been updated to take account in this latest guidance.	Amend paras 5.5,5.6,5.8-18 to reflect the revised SHMA.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A63	The source of the 2031 forecasts should be referenced	115	420	The text in this paragraph has been amended to reflect the revised position set out in the SHMA 2011.	Amend para 5.6
A64	The information on the 2007 SHMA is disproportionate and will be out of date when the revised SHMA is published	115	421	The 2011 SHMA North Yorkshire Sub-Regional SHMA is a more strategic study than the 2007 SHMA and therefore elements of the SHMA 2007 will remain to support the Core Strategy and other associated documents. In respect of housing need in York the 2011 Study provides a robust evidence based assessment. The Study concludes that there is a need for 790 affordable homes per annum.	Amend text in Principle 1 and associated Statements to reflect revised evidence base in SHMA 2011.
A65	Reference to source of study work should be included	115	422	The information relates to the SHMA, alongside all other information in this paragraph. (5.6)	Add SHMA reference
Statement 1: Affordable Housing					
A66	To reduce the level of low cost housing	4	4	The 2011 SHMA identifies a need for 790 new affordable homes per annum in York, which is currently in excess of the number of homes built across any tenure. New affordable housing is provided throughout the city in a number of ways, from government funded schemes through to requirements on private developments. Schemes such as British Sugar present key opportunities to provide a range and mix of house types and tenures. A proportion of these homes will be for affordable housing (both rent and sale) as part of a mixed community.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A67	Should be a mixed community and not exclusively affordable housing	27	67	Principle 1 states that a balanced community will be provided. A mix of housing types and tenures will be sought to meet the needs of a cross section of the community.	No Change
A68	Support for affordable housing and eco friendly environment	212	838	Noted	No Change
A69	Redevelopment could be restricted/delayed by the requirement for 50% affordable housing	56	160	Whilst there is a long term aspirational target of 50% affordable housing the level within a development will depend on specific site circumstances and prevailing market conditions. The level of affordable housing within the scheme will depend on viability appraisal to ensure deliverability. The revised targets for greenfield land should be reflected in para 5.11	Amend 5.11
A70	Support provision of a significant amount of affordable housing	74	225	The SPD sets out an approach to providing the maximum viable amounts of affordable housing in the development.	No Change
		144	648		
A71	Affordable housing should be priced to be affordable to working families	79	245	Affordable housing covers a range of tenures, and in York usually refers to homes for social rent and Discount Sale. The price of social rents is set by central government. Discount Sale homes currently range from £75,000 for a 2 bed flat to £110,000 for a 4 bed house, which are priced in line with average household incomes in the city.	No Change
A72	Affordable housing should be sited close to York Central site to enable easiest access to city	83	258	The location of affordable housing provided within the area will emerge through the subsequent planning process and be expected to be integrated throughout the development.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A73	The level of affordable housing will need to be assessed in line with guidance within PPS 3. The SPD will need to include a realistic appraisal of the costs associated with the redevelopment to inform the affordable housing target.	91	282	As required by PPS3 the level of affordable housing will be assessed according to local evidenced need and as part of a detailed viability appraisal of a scheme. Costs of a development will not be known until a scheme proposal is prepared and cannot therefore be included within the draft SPD. This will form part of detailed negotiations as part of the planning process.	No Change
A74	Provision of affordable housing will erode the proposed development	82	254	A range of housing options need to be available to allow all York's residents to have access to a home. The type of affordable housing provided should be indistinguishable from the market housing.	No Change
A75	Potential to make reference to the new affordable rented tenure	114	411	There are currently government proposals to allow a rent of up to 80% of market rents on homes built with grant funding. This opportunity will also be extended to re-lets level if the increased income is used to cross-subsidise new builds. These rents are classified as 'Affordable Rents', and would only apply to non-grant funded housing (such as at British Sugar) if the local authority so wishes. If CYC decided to replace social rents with the new 'Affordable Rents' there will of course be greater viability in schemes and, potentially therefore, more opportunity to increase affordable housing numbers without compromising developer profit.	There is currently no council decision as to the approach on non grant funded affordable rents and therefore no change is recommended.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A76	SPD does not mention new affordable rent product in assessing tenure needs. Impact of this on scheme viability and future tenure mix should be considered	115	418	There are ongoing central government discussions about an increase in 'social rent' to as high as 80% of market rent but this is a long way off any form of adoption and has received voluble objection. If it is approved there will of course be greater viability in schemes and, potentially therefore, more opportunity to increase affordable housing numbers (closer to actual need) without compromising developer profit.	No Change
A77	The methodology for determining "usefully affordable" housing is unclear and not evidenced. The approach is arbitrary, does not comply with national planning policy, and references to it should be deleted	115	423	Eligibility is key to providing affordable housing in York. Many households registered on the Council's Housing Waiting List will only be able to enter Council housing or Housing Association housing at low cost. Other households on the waiting list can potentially afford to pay slightly more in housing costs and wish to own their own house. These households are registered on the Discount Sale waiting list. Their ability to pay is calculated and, for mortgage purposes, lies between £55k and £110k depending on size of home. This generally equates to a 50-60% discount from open market value.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A78	Note that Affordable Housing targets of 25% applicable to the British Sugar site and long term target of 50% has been criticised by stakeholders and additional research is to be carried out. Until AHVS is found to be robust following examination of the draft Core Strategy a tentative target should be included within the SPD. Text should be amended to reflect this.	115	425	The methodology for the dynamic model set out in the District Viability Study recently produced by Fordham Research has been roundly accepted in principle, and recently accepted at Inquiry (Kensington & Chelsea). The conclusion that 25% affordable housing is viable and achievable on brownfield sites in York today is backed up by a thorough assessment of viability on a range of brownfield sites in the city, further supported by follow up research with the property forum. A thorough testing of assumptions set out within the study concludes that 25% is an accurate and realistic target to set. The greenfield target has been changed to 35% (Dec 2010). The text at paragraph 5.11 makes the temporal nature of this target very clear	Amend para 5.11 to reflect the updated target.
A79	The SHMA only refers to shared equity and discounted sale products and excludes intermediate rent. It is also based on pre-recession data. The tenure split for intermediate affordable housing (discounted sale/shared equity) should therefore be considered as a minimum.	115	424	The Council's definition of social rent and Discount Sale - which is clear, accountable and consistent - has been accepted on all other development sites in York. It provides certainty in decision making and fairness in negotiation and delivery. There is no reason to move away from this clear policy approach now and would go against Member endorsed policy. It would also contradict the consistency and certainty we have established with developers and consultants in York.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A80	Reference to perpetuity should be removed. PPS3 does not support this and at a recent public inquiry a 15 year period was taken as appropriate.	115	430	References to perpetuity in respect of affordable housing are long established throughout the country. PPS Annex B refers to "the home to be retained for future eligible households" (para 30). All schemes in York, as with other authorities, contain a reference to perpetuity in the Section 106 legal agreement. Without this, an affordable home would lose the benefits of affordability, which would be unacceptable. In reality, legal agreements often state that the period of eligibility will last in the region of 40 years.	No Change
A81	The text should be amended to reflect the mix of affordable housing should be based on proven need and not a pro-rata of market mix.	115	426	The 'pro rata' approach to affordable housing in York reflects national and local guidance on inclusion and also provides a very transparent and consistent base for developers in assessing viability and assembling land bids. It is widely accepted as a fair starting point. Negotiation on a site by site basis can then proceed, with reference to housing need and overall residual value. It should be noted that in York there is housing need across every house type and size.	No Change
		115	427		
A82	Wording in para 5.12 and Figure 10 should be amended to acknowledge the aspirational rather than fixed nature of affordable dwelling transfer prices.	115	431	Setting aspirational transfer prices is a policy approach supported by York house builders, giving certainty and consistency when assessing site viability and compiling land bids. The prices refer to the Housing Waiting List, which identifies eligible households' ability to enter the owner occupied market, albeit at a substantially discounted rate. The prices are set at a level which allows Housing Associations to purchase and then mortgage out at levels affordable to those households identified as being in need. The text in the SPD outlines that the figures given are current and will be subject to review.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A83	Need for a clear link with affordable housing policy being brought forward in the Core Strategy. Suggest change to statement wording to "Affordable housing will be negotiated, taking into consideration the most up to date economic viability assessment, market information and funding regime"	119	513	Suggest reference to negotiations being informed by most up to date economic viability assessment and market conditions be included in Statement 1.	Amend Statement 1.
Statement 2: Housing Type and Size					
A84	No need for flats	29	96	One of the overriding strategic objectives for the development of this area is to create a new sustainable and inclusive community. This will involve a mix of different housing types, including both flats and houses. Para 5.14 acknowledges that given the location of the site this may involve a higher proportion of houses but nevertheless a mix of housing to meet a sustainable balanced market will be necessary.	No Change.
A85	Need accommodation to be flexible in terms of future occupation	47	134	Para 5.18 outlines that all new homes will need to address the requirement in the Core Strategy to be built with flexible living accommodation to Lifetime Home standards.	No Change.
A86	Type of housing should comprise family housing with bungalows but not flats	66	212	One of the overriding strategic objectives for the development of this area is to create a new sustainable and inclusive community. This will involve a mix of different housing type, including both flats and houses. Para 5.14 acknowledges that given the location of the site this may involve a higher proportion of houses but nevertheless a mix of housing to meet a sustainable balanced market will be necessary.	No Change.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A87	Two storey semi-detached housing should be provided not terraced to ensure space within the development	69	218	A mix of housing size and type will be sought to create a new sustainable community, within a high quality environment.	No Change
A88	Housing should be restricted to 2 storey	84	259	Statement 3 refers to the densities relating to design and placemaking issues. It is not prescriptive in terms of building heights but any proposals would need to ensure visual, amenity and the character of residential areas adjoining the boundaries are taken into account.	Amend para 5.20 to refer to character of residential areas adjoining the boundaries.
A89	Document should refer to need for rather than demand for social housing	115	432	Noted. Para 5.14 could be amended to reflect this.	Amend para 5.14
A90	Object to the preclusion of provision of flatted affordable housing on the site	115	433	This reference could be deleted as although the greatest need is for larger units one bedroom units may have a role in schemes	Amend 5.14 to delete reference to social rented flats and and 5.16 to delete reference to one bedroom flats.
A91	The reference to one bedroom flats not being required by the HCA should be referenced.	115	428	The reference could be deleted as although the greatest need is for larger units one bedroom units may have a role in schemes.	Amend 5.14 to delete reference to social rented flats and 5.16 to delete reference to one bedroom flats.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A92	The priority need for two/three bedroom family houses should be referenced.	115	429	The SHMA 2011 reveals that housing need for all property sizes, far outstrips the current or future supply. However the highest need, as evidenced in the SHMA, is for 2, 3 and 4+ bedroom units. CYC's policy is very clear that the starting point for any development is for a pro rata mix of house types. This reflects that affordable housing need is across all house types, but also that we must build mixed sustainable communities. However, if amending the mix of homes on a site by site basis is more beneficial to the overall housing offer this may be negotiated. This ensures homes of every type can be achieved, but adapted where necessary to focus on priority need. Para 5.16 could be amended to refer to source of information in SHMA.	Amend para 5.16 to refer to source of information in SHMA
A93	Single person dwellings need to be provided.	143	647	Whilst there is a need for all house types and size, single person households do not necessarily want or require one bedroom accommodation. The aspiration of current and future tenants is a key consideration to ensure housing stock does not become obsolete with changing demands over time. Additionally, many single person households may have parental or guardianship responsibilities at weekends or through the week.	No Change.
A94	Suggest amendments to wording of Statement 2 in order to reference temporal nature of evidence base. Suggest change to "Housing size and type will contribute to achieving a balanced housing market through meeting the needs of the community based on the use of the most up to date SHMA findings"	119	514	Statement doesn't need such fundamental revision to reflect temporal nature of evidence base. Suggest revision to "Housing size and type will contribute to achieving a balanced housing market through meeting the needs of a cross section of the community. This will be achieved through taking into account the most up to date SHMA findings in the context of the sites location and anticipated future needs.	Amend Statement 2

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
Statement 3: Housing Density					
A95	High density housing should be avoided	59	172	High density housing is not being promoted, the text refers to housing densities appropriate for suburban sites.	No Change
A96	Clarification on the number of dwellings to be provided	80	246	The number of dwellings provided will depend on scheme design to be progressed in subsequent stages of the planning process. The number of dwellings outlined in the draft policy in the emerging Core Strategy is an estimated figure which will be revised following this work.	No Change
A97	Concern regarding the number of dwelling outlined	106	342	The number of dwellings provided will depend on scheme design to be progressed in subsequent stages of the planning process.	No Change
A98	Keep residential well spaced	107	353	Noted	No Change
A99	Support minimum net housing density of 40 dph	115	434	Noted	No Change
A100	Welcome the reference to the density target figure being subject to other considerations.	135	595	Noted	No Change
A101	Site specific issues and the character of the surrounding area should inform scheme densities	119	515	The reference to Core Strategy target densities should remain since these are appropriate for York. The text at paragraph 5.20 could be amended to refer to the character of residential areas adjoining the boundaries in addition to the other issues outlined in this para.	Amend para 5.20 to refer to the character of adjoining residential areas at the boundary of the development.
Principle 2: Provision of social infrastructure in a planned and phased manner which complements and integrates with existing facilities					
A102	Agree with principle	63	177	Noted	No Change
A103	Agree but highlight need for a feasible and deliverable scheme	119	516	Reference to feasibility and deliverability is included at paragraphs 5.25 and 8.11	No Change
Statement 4: Provision of social infrastructure					
General					
A104	Support community facilities for residents	7	8	Noted	No Change
		63	191		
		19	52		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A105	Support need for a community focus	207	808	Noted	No Change
A106	Type of community facilities should relate to the number and type of housing provided, eg elderly and families	14	34	Noted	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A107	Undertake a survey to scope the type of units for the local facilities	21	62	Noted	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
		30	111		
A108	Development should be self-serving to reduce travelling	109	378	Noted	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A109	Existing residents in surrounding area should be able to access facilities in order to integrate new community	117	502	Noted	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A110	Query whether all of the facilities are relevant to this size of development	156	700	The scale of facilities will relate to the number of people likely to be accommodated in the development. The scale of facilities outlined in the draft SPD are for indicative purposes. Due to the scale of development envisaged it is likely that all the facilities outlined will be required by the newly arising population, although the extent to which existing facilities could be utilised will be subject to further investigation and discussion as part of subsequent stages of the planning process.	No Change
A111	Further detail needed on "electronic information and workspace facilities"	115	436	Noted. The text in para 5.35 could be amended to explain this further.	Amend para 5.35

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A112	Further detail needed on "eco community hub"	115	437	Clarification on the related nature of the eco hub community facilities with other community facilities could be given within the list of social infrastructure. Para 5.24 could be amended to refer to potential for the facilities to be combined. Para 6.10 could be expanded to give greater detail on this.	Amend para 5.24 and 6.10
A113	Reference to open space, transport and training/ skills should be deleted as these are not relevant to social infrastructure	115	438	These references were included as the issues were considered to be interrelated. However, for clarity reference to open space as an element of related social infrastructure could be retained and reference to transport and training/skills could be deleted.	Amend para 5.25
A114	Provision of community facilities should have regard to building on current local provision and enhancing/complementing this.	124	553	Principle 2 outlines that social infrastructure should be provided to complement and integrate with existing facilities. Para 5.22 recognises that whilst there may be capacity in existing provision new or extended facilities may be appropriate to meet the needs of the community.	No Change
A115	Opportunity for community project at masterplanning stage should not be lost.	120	525	Noted	Comments to be passed onto the landowners
A116	Suggest this statement is combined with statements 5 & 6.	119	517	Statement 4 is focused on the type of community facilities, Statement 5 on the location of these facilities and Statement 6 on specific employment use. These are therefore separate issues and it is appropriate that they are covered in different statements.	No Change
A117	Suggest reference is made to requirements for developer contributions set out in CIL regulations and circular 05/2005	119	518	Developer contributions are covered in paras 8.11 to 8.16.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A118	Community facilities should be planned together at the outline stage rather than in an ad hoc manner as development progresses	157	710	Figure 19 sets out the documents which should accompany the outline planning application and includes a Community and Leisure Facilities Statement which will include reference to phasing.	No Change
A119	Balanced development should be provided which provides for additional demands on services funded by the developers	211	833	Para 5.26 outlines the need for new services or facilities to be provided if a need is shown to arise through the development. Opportunities to link commercial facilities with other social infrastructure should be explored. Para 5.26 and 6.24 could be amended to reflect this. Para 8.11 also outlines that the provision of such facilities will be required through developer contributions and public funding if available. To ensure provision of services for the new community suggest additional text is added at para 8.13 for the financial sustainability of the facilities to be addressed.	Amend para 5.26, 6.24 and 8.13
A120	Good mix of facilities outlined which should cover most local needs	218	871	Noted	No Change
Shops					
A121	Local shopping facilities are sufficient and should be used as these are more sustainable.	8	10	Need has been demonstrated in the retail evidence base to support the LDF and also in the initial needs assessment carried out by the Council to support the draft SPD. Reference has been clearly made in the document to the requirement for the applicants to provide a 'needs' assessment in line with the requirements of PPS4.	No Change
		86	270		
		9	15		
		152	684		
A122	There is no need for shops as this will divert trade from existing centres and the road infrastructure is inadequate	206	798	A retail impact assessment will be required as part of any planning application. This will assess the impact on existing retail provision in the area.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A123	Avoid larger supermarket	13	27	Noted	No Change
		98	303		
		149	671		
A124	Support smaller shops	13	28	Noted	No Change
		108	366		
A125	Support mini supermarket	98	303	Noted	No Change
		109	379		
		76	231		
A126	Shops should be sited together with pedestrian access	13	29	Noted	No Change
A127	Should provide a supermarket	45	129	Noted	No Change
		17	48		
		81	251		
A128	Support a range of small/ specialist/ independent shops	15	38	Noted	No Change
		58	168		
		63	191		
		21	62		
		79	243		
		74	226		
		29	97		
		30	102		
		107	352		
		76	231		
		109	379		
		151	675		
		155	698		
		117	503		
213	845				
A129	Support large supermarket with delivery facilities accessible to existing Boroughbridge Rd residents	20	54	The intention is to relate the scale of retail provision to newly arising local shopping needs.	No Change
A130	Support provision of shops	102	319	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A131	Support provision of local shops	121	530	Noted	No Change
		216	861		
		197	761		
A132	Locating shops centrally in the site will reduce their financial viability	33	110	The provision of services in an accessible new centre is intended to maximise accessibility by sustainable modes of transport and provide a focus for the community. Evidence of unviable retail provision would need to be provided to substantiate this case. Para 5.39 does not refer to the location of facilities being central, but sited to maximise accessibility.	No Change
A133	Locating shops in a parade will attract antisocial behaviour	33	110	Siting shops together will increase the attraction of the Local Centre. By co-locating with other community facilities this will increase activity and personal safety. A busy Local Centre is less likely to encourage antisocial behaviour. Safety and security issues will be examined in more detail in the design and layout of any scheme in liaison with the Police Liaison Officer in order to minimise any issues.	No Change
A134	Reference to small supermarket is unduly prescriptive and premature	115	435	The intention is to relate the scale of provision to local shopping needs. The text could be amended to reflect this.	Amend para 5.24 to refer to neighbourhood foodstore to meet primarily newly arising local needs.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A135	The quantum of floorspace set out seems to be based on an assumed impact on Acomb centre. Detailed impact assessment will be undertaken as part of the masterplanning process. Rather than setting out quantum's of floorspace, the SPD could state that the supermarket should be of a scale that does not adversely impact on Acomb district centre.	115	435	Need for convenience shopping provision to be provided as part of the former British Sugar development has been established in the York Retail Study, 2008 and explored in more detail in background work to the draft SPD. To minimise the need to travel, and provide a focal point for activity within the development, a 'local neighbourhood centre' should be established. This should provide shopping, leisure and other services for new residents, and should be of a scale and nature that complements, rather than competes with facilities in the surrounding area including Acomb District Centre. It is not considered that the reference to need for convenience shopping provision within the site is unduly prescriptive in the context of background work undertaken. Reference has been clearly made in the document to the requirement for the applicants to provide a 'needs' assessment in line with the requirements of PPS4.	No Change
A136	Concern that quantified floorspace of 1000-1500 sq metres isn't sufficiently robustly justified, and represents a maximum threshold that would be contrary to policy	115	440	The quantum of floorspace given are indicative and do not represent a maximum level, this is clearly set out in the accompanying text.	No Change
A137	Support small collection of general shops at the edge of the industrial area, serviced by industrial roads.	128	563	The provision of services in an accessible new centre is intended to maximise accessibility by sustainable modes of transport and provide a focus for the community. The new local centre should provide shopping, leisure and other services principally for new residents and be of a scale and nature that complements existing provision.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A138	A small supermarket (para 5.24) does not accord with the local food store description in para 5.32. Small retail outlets would underpin local identity and should include reference to local police office, pub and post office.	135	596	There is not considered to be any inconsistency in the guidance given. Complementary shops and units are referred to in para 5.32 with provision on commercial terms.	No Change
A139	A small comprehensive food store/supermarket but avoid any damaging effect on Poppleton shops.	123	538	The intention is to relate the scale of provision to meet newly arising local needs. A retail impact assessment will be required as part of any planning application.	No Change
Sports/Recreation					
A140	Should provide leisure facilities	46	132	The draft SPD reflects the need for community facilities including leisure facilities	No Change
		63	191		
		74	226		
		13	30		
A141	Should provide built sports facilities	13	30	The draft SPD reflects the need for community facilities including sports facilities. However there needs to be appropriate infrastructure to manage these facilities. Further clarification as to the provision of on site sports hall facilities could be provided in para 5.33.	Amend para 5.33
		108	363		
		111	388		
		151	678		
A142	Should provide outdoor/indoor netball courts	46	132	Could be provided as part of the outdoor sport package if a club/users are identified during the development process.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A143	Should provide tennis facilities	46	132	Could be provided as part of the outdoor sport package if a club/users are identified during the development process.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
		108	362		
		111	385		
A144	Should provide squash facilities	46	132	No local evidence to support the need for this facility.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A145	Should provide a swimming pool	48	140	The site is within the catchment area of Energise swimming pool.	No Change
		108	364		
		111	387		
A146	Should provide fitness centre	13	30	The site is close to other fitness facilities. A commercial operator can include fitness facilities as part of the community facilities should they wish to do so.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A147	Should provide community stadium served by shuttle rail service	76	233	Extensive audit work has been undertaken to identify appropriate sites	No Change
A148	Clarification on the nature of built sports requirements and their application within the city requested	115	441	Noted. The built facilities section of the LDF is a public document.	No Change
Library					
A149	Should provide a branch library with internet facilities.	34	113	The draft SPD outlines the need for community facilities on site. The type of facilities are to be further explored through masterplanning and public consultation. The inclusion of library facilities within the new community facility on site will need to be explored whilst taking account of the level of existing facilities within the area, including proximity to the Acomb Explore Centre.	No Change
Pub/Restaurants					
A150	Should provide a public house	35	115	The draft SPD outlines appropriate uses within a Local Centre and includes A4 Uses (Drinking establishments).	No Change
		58	168		
		17	48		
		81	251		
		109	380		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A151	Need to ensure no adverse impact on adjoining eating places in Poppleton Business Park and Poppleton.	123	539	The scale of local facilities to be provided within the site are directed towards addressing local needs arising from the development. Adverse impact on adjoining restaurants in Poppleton Business Park and Poppleton is a commercial consideration and is not an issue which can be considered in the assessment of any proposals.	No Change
Health					
A152	Should provide medical/dental facilities	58 86 46 17 81 109	168 271 132 48 251 376	Provision of medical and dental facilities will depend on the level of existing provision within the area and whether, if necessary, it is appropriate to expand such provision. The draft SPD does refer to the need to provide new social infrastructure, potentially including a new GP, dentist and other health care facilities. This will be explored further during the planning process.	No Change
Built Sports					
A153	Any off site swimming facilities should also include a community bus and the running costs of this for a defined period.	135	597	It would not be reasonable to require a developer to provide a community bus facility. New occupiers would have access to the public transport system in York, as would all other residents/users of such a facility within the city.	No Change
Education					
A154	Support education provision	102 109	321 376	Noted	No Change
A155	Existing education facilities are already at capacity so new facilities will be required	51 140 145	149 640 654	The need for additional education provision will be assessed to take account of existing capacity and the provision of new facilities to meet the emerging needs of the site. Statement 4 of the draft SPD outlines this requirement.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A156	New secondary school should not be provided off site	61	175	The number of secondary school pupils likely to be generated by this development would not require a new school to be provided. The draft SPD refers to off-site financial contributions being required for secondary school places.	No Change
A157	Interest in using former Manor School building as a Community Secondary School	61	174	The number of secondary school pupils likely to be generated by this development would not require a new school to be provided. The draft SPD refers to off-site financial contributions being required for secondary school places.	No Change
A158	New primary school should be provided	86	271	It is likely that a new primary school would be required and this is outlined in Statement 4 of the draft SPD.	No Change
A159	Concern that new primary and secondary schools will be needed but government are cutting spending. Existing secondary schools in the area are already stretched	214	847	The need for additional education provision will be assessed to take account of existing capacity and the provision of new facilities to meet the emerging needs of the site. Statement 4 of the draft SPD outlines this requirement.	No Change
A160	Any new school should include a theatre due to the child development benefits arising from such facilities	90	279	The design of any new school is determined centrally by the Department for Education	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A161	Support provision of all-through (nursery-primary-secondary) school	109	377	This type of provision is supported by both the local authority and DfE in principle, if feasible, and if appropriate levels of demand can be demonstrated.	No Change
A162	Concern about deliverability of off-site secondary school provision	112	397	Off site provision would not entail a new site.	No Change
		144	653	Expansion of provision on existing sites would be the initial approach, depending on demand.	
		199	770		
A163	Document needs for detail on education	146	658	Further information is available in the advice note on Developer Contributions to Education facilities.	No Change
A164	Figures for pupil generation should be updated	115	439	The figures for pupil generation can be calculated on the basis of a proposed detailed type and mix of residential development.	No Change
A165	Suggest that quantification of pupil generation and school land requirements is premature in advance of masterplanning	115	439	Paras 5.29-5.31 outline that the estimated pupil numbers are indicative and estimates. The final size of facilities will be dependent on the size and composition of development proposals.	No Change
A166	A secondary school is needed on the development site.	123	543	From the capacity analysis work undertaken to date is unlikely that the number of pupils generated by the development would support a new additional secondary school in the area. As outlined in para 5.31, off-site provision is likely to be secured.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A167	A new primary school should be provided which could also provide other activities for community use.	123	536	From the capacity analysis work undertaken to date it is likely that a primary school would be required on site. Opportunities for community use of facilities will be explored through the masterplanning and planning process.	No Change
A168	Concern over capacity of existing secondary schools in particular Manor School	137	632	The local authority would look to provide additional places beyond those currently offered by the local secondary schools and academies.	No Change
		212	840		
A169	Retain existing former Manor School building as junior school instead of a road through the site.	121	526	Part of the former Manor School site has been identified through the LDF as a housing site. The site is also identified as one of two options to provide access onto the A59. The spatial distribution of uses within the site will emerge through the masterplanning and planning process	No Change
A170	The former Manor School building is a good quality build and one of best school buildings in York	207	809	Manor school moved to their new site because of issues with the size, design and maintenance of the former school building, including: poor condition; expensive to maintain; asbestos issues; noncompliance with disabled accessibility requirements; too small for number of pupils.	No Change
Community Hall					
A171	Support a community hall with facilities for a variety of entertainment uses eg dancing	20	55	The draft SPD outlines the need for community facilities on site. The type of facilities are to be further explored through masterplanning and public consultation.	No Change
A172	Community hall should provide flexible accommodation to allow use as a place of worship. Should also provide storage facilities in the initial design concept	217	866	The draft SPD outlines the need for flexible community facilities on site. The type of facilities are to be further explored through masterplanning and public consultation.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A173	Community hall should provide facilities for all ages	21	61	The draft SPD outlines the need for flexible community facilities on site. The type of facilities are to be further explored through masterplanning and public consultation.	No Change
		58	168		
A174	Support retention of Manor School building for community use	38	121	Part of the former Manor School site has been identified through the LDF as a housing site. The site is also identified as one of two options to provide access onto the A59. The spatial distribution of uses within the site will emerge through the masterplanning and planning process	No Change
		102	317		
		90	278		
		106	345		
		146	662		
A175	Support provision of space for community organisations who can organise events and manage facilities	30	101	The draft SPD outlines the need for flexible community facilities on site. The type of facilities are to be further explored through masterplanning and public consultation.	No Change
A176	Should provide social facilities for performing/ visual arts	13	30	The draft SPD outlines the need for flexible community facilities on site. The type of facilities are to be further explored through masterplanning and public consultation.	No Change
A177	Support community hall	109	380	Noted	No Change
		151	675		
		153	689		
A178	A Youth Club should be provided.	123	537	The draft SPD outlines the need for flexible community facilities on site. The type of facilities are to be further explored through masterplanning and public consultation.	No Change
A179	A community hall should be provided which will support and promote positive and effective integration with the existing community	124	557	Statement 4 of the draft SPD outlines the need for social infrastructure and community facilities on site.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A180	Retain former Manor School buildings as a community facility	123	541	The part of the site occupied by the former Manor School buildings has been identified through the LDF as a housing site. The spatial distribution of uses within the site will emerge through the masterplanning and planning process.	No Change
A181	Support a community social centre to replace the previous facility on site	197	762	Statement 4 of the draft SPD outlines the need for social infrastructure and community facilities on site.	No Change
Other					
A182	Support provision of public WC	29	97	Provision for public conveniences are made within the city centre and the district centres. There are no plans to provide these facilities in other smaller centres or residential areas within the city.	No Change
A183	Support for a place of worship with flexibility for use by different denominations.	123	542	The draft SPD outlines the need for flexible community facilities on site. The type of facilities are to be further explored through masterplanning and public consultation.	No Change
A184	Support for a post office	123	540	Noted	No Change
A185	Developers should provide schools and health centres for new development	212 211	837 832	Statement 4 of the draft SPD outlines the need for social infrastructure to be provided for the new community, including education and healthcare provision where required.	No Change
A186	Support supermarket/petrol station	220	882	Noted. Statement 4 of the draft SPD sets out appropriate types of social infrastructure to be provided for the new community	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
Statement 5: Location of Social Infrastructure: New Local Centre					
A187	Siting should ensure congestion is not increased due to access.	10	18	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site.	No Change
A188	Community facilities, including a new primary school should be grouped centrally within the site to serve as a focal point.	16	42	The spatial distribution of uses within the site will be explored further through the masterplanning and planning process. Statement 5 does outline the advantages of a single accessible local centre in terms of accessibility for future residents and a focal point for activity. Suggest para 5.35 is amended to refer to co-locational opportunities with primary school facilities.	Amend para 5.35
A189	Community facilities should be located at the rear of the site	49	145	The spatial distribution of uses within the site will be explored further through the masterplanning and planning process.	No Change
A190	New facilities should be accessible to residents in Boroughbridge Road estates	56	164	Good walking and cycling connections should be provided within the development to link with the surrounding area.	No Change
		210	825		
A191	Welcome integration of new local centre with sustainable transport and green infrastructure networks due to sustainable design benefits	64	195	Noted.	No Change
A192	Shops should not be located at the back of the development, thereby encouraging traffic to be routed past housing	79	244	The spatial distribution of uses within the site will be explored further through the masterplanning and planning process.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A193	Community facilities should be easily accessible for walkers/car drivers and cyclists.	130	576	Statement 5 of the draft SPD outlines the need for local centre facilities to be served by sustainable transport. Transport movement within the site should ensure accessibility to key uses. Suggest reference to linking public transport with key social infrastructure facilities is made in para 7.23	Amend text at para 7.23
A194	Community facilities should be located to be within walking distance so it is not necessary to use a car	223	891	Accessibility of community facilities by sustainable means of travel are required in Statement 5 of the draft SPD.	No Change
A195	The option of reusing the existing school buildings as part of a new community hall should be seriously considered as this would support sustainable development	90	278	The part of the site occupied by the former Manor School buildings has been identified through the LDF as a housing site. The spatial distribution of uses within the site will emerge through the masterplanning and planning process.	No Change
A196	The location of new community facilities should be central for everyone to use.	120	524	Accessibility of community facilities for all future occupiers of the development by sustainable means of travel is sought in Statement 5 of the draft SPD.	No Change
A197	Welcome approach of ensuring development fits with green infrastructure which will ensure functionality is maximised	64	197	Noted.	No Change
Principle 3: To maximise the benefits of sustainable economic growth for the local community					
A198	Question ability to generate economic growth and training through a housing development	152	680	Economic benefits will arise through the construction of the development which is anticipated to take place over a 10-15 year timeframe. Statement 6 outlines small scale offices could be appropriate and compatible with a local centre. A small number of jobs are also anticipated to be created through the local centre provision of services.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A199	Do not need more industry- already crowded rural area	140	642	Industry is not a suggested use for the area.	No Change
A200	A permanent centre for training and skills development should be provided	135	598	Training and skills development during construction will be sought in the planning application. Training opportunities may emerge from sustainable technologies used in the development.	No Change
Statement 6: Small scale B1 uses					
A201	Need for job creation to support local businesses	29	98	A small number of jobs are anticipated to be created through the local centre provision of services.	No Change
A202	Mixed development creates social responsibility and cohesion and sustainable living	59	173	Noted.	No Change
A203	Support light industry or workshop based employment located away from residential areas	63	180	There are several existing employment uses in the area which could provide employment opportunities. Any employment opportunities provided on site will need to be compatible with the primarily residential use of the site.	No Change
A204	Support retention of land for industrial purposes to reprovide manufacturing jobs.	71	223	The emerging Core Strategy identifies future employment land and premises to fulfill future employment needs to 2030. Industry is not a suggested use for the area.	No Change
A205	Support business development in advance of housing	98	304	The emerging Core Strategy identifies future employment land and premises to fulfill future employment needs to 2030.	No Change
A206	No current need for speculative business development in York	98	305	The inclusion of any small scale employment uses as part of a local centre will depend on market and viability considerations. Statement 6 of the draft SPD outlines small scale offices could be appropriate and compatible with a local centre.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A207	Potential to meet needs associated with start-up businesses	107	352	The inclusion of any small scale employment uses as part of a local centre will depend on market and viability considerations.	No Change
A208	Note that draft core strategy policy doesn't reference B1 land uses and support the fact that this is not a requirement	115	442	Noted.	No Change
A209	Infrastructure should include broadband and other cable facilities and be implemented at the start of the development.	135	599	Noted.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A210	New employment facilities are needed within the area to provide work for new residents	198	763	Land is identified at Northminster Business Park and York Business Park for employment uses within the emerging Core Strategy. The take up of employment land is dependent upon economic circumstances and investment decisions by employers. Statement 6 outlines small scale offices could be appropriate and compatible with a local centre.	No Change
A211	Area does not need more low skilled/low paid jobs, need investment into providing higher skilled paying jobs	206	800	The development of the site will be for primarily residential purposes. A range of employment opportunities are supported elsewhere in the city.	No Change
Statement 7: Training and skills development programme					
A212	Document needs more detail on job creation and training	146	659	Training and skills development during construction will be sought in the planning application. A Training Skills and Development Statement will be required as part of a planning application as outlined in Figure 19. Training opportunities may emerge from sustainable technologies used in the development.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A213	Every effort should be made to source materials and workforce locally	117	496	The use of local labour, and linkages with existing educational facilities is outlined in Statement 7, para 5.44. The sourcing of local materials is a more sustainable approach to development and reference to this could be made in para 6.5.	Amend para 6.5 to make reference to local sourcing of materials
A214	This is a short term measure for provision of jobs and will not provide jobs once building has finished	214	848	This is primarily a site allocated for housing purposes. A limited number of jobs will be created with the provision of local facilities on site.	No Change
A215	Job creation and training should focus on jobs which contribute to making York a more sustainable city	223	892	Noted.	No Change
Theme 2: Quality Place/Environment					
A216	Additional references should be included in Figure 11 9PPS23/PPS25/Contaminated Land Strategy/Model procedures for the Management of Land Contamination CLR11 (Environment Agency)	132	579	Noted. Reference could be made to this in Figure 11.	Amend Figure 11 to make reference to PPS23: Planning and Pollution Control. Annex 2 - Development on Land Affected by Contaminated Land (2004).
Principle 4: To ensure the highest achievable standards of sustainability are embedded at all stages of the development					
A217	Agree with principle	63	178	Noted	No Change.
		111	390		
A218	Welcome the vision to promote greener and more sustainable living	64	193	Noted	No Change.
A219	SPD could outline how on site renewable energy generation, other low carbon technology and combined heat and power scheme could be used on both this site and York Central.	91	284	A Local Carbon Framework has been produced by consultants CO2 Sense to advise on the potential for renewable energy systems within the York Northwest area. The study reviews the potential for a range of energy options and advises on their deliverability and the investment opportunities for energy providers. Reference will be made to this study in paragraph 3.5.	Amend para 3.5 to include reference to the Local Carbon Framework study.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A220	Need to use SUDS	107	354	The Sustainable Design and Construction SPD requires a SUDS evaluation and a number of other sustainability requirements as part of a planning application. Figure 19 also outlines the need for a Water Cycle Management Strategy and Sustainability Statement as part of any planning application.	No Change.
A221	Clarification needed on definition of sustainable.	138	637	Further clarification of the term sustainable could be made in para 4.3	Amend para 4.3 to make reference to sustainable development
A222	Development should be car free in order to attain highest standards of sustainability	223	885	Whilst car free zones within the development was suggested in earlier consultation this has not been included within the SPD guidance. The guidance seeks to reduce car dependency within the development with zones of low car parking provision and promotion of car clubs. Areas of car free development which have car club provision and are located in close proximity to public transport provision will be encouraged.	No Change.
Statement 8: Minimise environmental impact of development					
A223	Before construction takes place the service requirements of the development should be addressed	14	35	A Phasing Strategy is required as part of the planning application documents, as outlined in Figure 19. This will require the phased delivery of key and supporting infrastructure to the development as it is built out.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A224	Support pioneering sustainable development	30	103	Reference to the Urban Eco Settlement status of the site could also be made in the context of the York Northwest area. Work has recently been carried out by CO2 Sense on a Local Carbon Framework for York Northwest which identifies possible feasible and detailed renewable/low carbon energy solutions and will be used to guide the development approach. The approach taken to promote sustainable development on this site will be used as a model for other developments within the city. Reference to the study could be made in paragraph 6.5. The funding context to support a demonstration scheme has changed, although the intention is to pursue opportunities within the urban eco settlement programme if available.	Amend para 2.11 to refer to the Urban Eco Settlement, para 6.5 to include reference to Local Carbon Framework study and para 4.7 to reflect the change in funding context.
A225	Welcome low/zero carbon development	52	153	Noted	No Change
A226	Consideration should be given to wildlife issues in the design of zero carbon buildings and published research on this issue	52	154	The ecological impact of proposals will be fully assessed as part of the consideration of any scheme.	No Change
A227	Welcome the requirement to meet high levels of Code for Sustainable Homes standards	64	194	Noted	No Change
A228	Sustainable development should be overriding objective with above minimum standards sought	210	820	The guidance states in para 6.2 that sustainability has been accepted by the public and council as the guiding principle behind the York Northwest project from its outset. Above minimum standards of development is already referred to in Para 6.4 which states that where possible and financially viable, delivery of housing to higher levels of the Code will be sought prior to 2016.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A229	The role of green infrastructure in climate change adaption could be explored further (see The Yorkshire and Humber Climate Change Adaption Study)	64	201	Opportunities for the development to respond to and ensure it delivers climate change adaption are integral to the sustainable approach to development promoted in the draft SPD. For example, the ability of the design of the development to respond to future water supply fluctuations and drought conditions will need to be addressed in the Water Cycle Management Strategy. The Water Cycle Management Strategy should demonstrate that the development will minimise use of water, recycle water previously used by the development and address water storage, drainage and flooding issues. The need for the approach to green infrastructure to adapt to future climate change could also be highlighted. A Water Cycle Management Strategy is already required in Figure 19.	Amend para 6.26 to refer to climate change adaption.
A230	Should seek to implement site-wide renewable or low carbon technologies from outset of the development to deliver CfSH standards. Enabling retrofitting to early phases will not be feasible	114	409	Work has recently been carried out by CO2 Sense on a Local Carbon Framework for York Northwest which identifies possible feasible and detailed renewable/low carbon energy solutions and this work will be used to guide the development approach. Reference to the study could be made in paragraph 6.5.	Amend para 6.5 to refer to Local Carbon Framework study
A231	Recommend that site meets minimum of CfSH level 6 for energy	114	410	CfSH level 6 for energy cannot be required but delivery to higher standards will be sought, where possible, prior to statutory levels becoming mandatory.	No Change
A232	To register interest as a Yorkshire based heat pump manufacturer to be involved in the development	201	779	Noted	Comments to be passed onto landowner.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A233	Should be a principle on renewable energy in order to attain eco housing on the site	202	781	Principle 4 covers sustainable development which is overarching and covers renewable energy as well as other sustainable aspects of a development including a sustainable approach to managing water consumption, green infrastructure and waste.	No Change
A234	On site renewable energy should be maximised and achieve higher than 10% if possible	223	886	Work has recently been carried out by CO2 Sense on a Local Carbon Framework for York Northwest which identifies possible feasible and detailed renewable/low carbon energy solutions and this work will be used to guide the development approach. Reference to the study could be made in paragraph 6.5.	Amend para 6.5 to refer to Local Carbon Framework study
A235	Air source heating systems do not work efficiently, are difficult to operate and are not proven technology	209	818	Air Source Heat Pumps were not considered in the Local Carbon Framework as potential low carbon and renewable energy supplies as they are not eligible for grant funding and there are concerns around their efficiency, costs and how the heat delivered would be measured.	No Change
A236	There is a need to recognise the potential impact on viability in meeting the code level timetable	119	519	The guidance refers in the first instance to statutory CfSH levels. Delivery of higher standards is linked to an assessment of financial viability.	No Change
A237	Recommend that the SPD allows for flexibility in terms of sustainability assessment methodology (for example using "BREEAM communities" assessment rather than the "Code for Sustainable Homes")	115	443	Noted. Paras 6.4 and 6.6 could be amended to refer to alternative of meeting equivalent environmental standard to CfSH or BREEAM.	Amend paras 6.4 and 6.6

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A238	The highest standards of sustainable development should be achieved throughout and reference to 'a significant proportion of development' and 'where possible and financially viable' should be deleted.	135	600	Principle 4 seeks to ensure the highest achievable standards of sustainability. Statement 8 refers to the statutory requirements arising from Part L of the Building Regulations 2006. In advance of 2016 It is not possible to insist on delivery of housing to the highest Code levels if this would make the scheme unviable or undeliverable. Suggest deletion of 'where possible'. Further clarification could be given as to why this would be relevant to a significant proportion of development in para 6.3	Amend para 6.3 and 6.4
A239	The target of meeting total energy needs should be amended to be at least 50% through renewables. Application of this to all non housing construction and street lighting should be clarified. The phrase 'subject to feasibility' should be omitted.	135	601	The Local Carbon Framework for York Northwest is a specific study on the opportunities for renewable energy on this site. This will guide the scope of energy systems to be considered. It is not possible therefore at this stage to be specific about the percentage of energy provided by renewable systems. Paragraph 6.6 should be amended to refer to the study. BREEAM standards or their equivalent will be sought for all non residential buildings and para 6.6 refers to this. The provision of energy efficient street lighting will be encouraged and is supported by the council for all adopted street lighting in the city. Para 6.22 could be amended to refer to low carbon lighting.	Amend para 6.6 to refer to the Local Carbon Framework study and para 6.22 to refer to low carbon lighting.
A240	The Marston Moor IDB agree with the principles in statement and this paragraph, managing surface water sustainably through a water strategy. Request consultation at an early stage	205	792	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A241	Highly efficient 'passivhaus' construction should be considered in early stages as CHP and district heating will not be economical in the early years.	135	602	The councils Interim Planning Statement on Sustainable Design and Construction sets out criteria for assessing how the sustainability of a scheme will be judged. The Local Carbon Framework will advise on the the application and delivery of energy systems within the site and the funding opportunities eg from Feed In Tariffs. Passivhaus, passive solar design and other sustainable design solutions will be considered through the planning process.	No Change
A242	Concern about rigid stipulation of code level achievement in absence of reference to grant funding	115	444	The references to the code levels are the statutory levels required by building regulations. Higher levels of delivery are sought within the context of financial viability considerations and additional text could be added to refer to use of grant funding. The Local Carbon Framework will consider the costs of provision of renewable energy systems and the estimated pay back periods with ESCo providers and contributions from government funding schemes for example, the Renewable Heat Incentive proposed to be available for the generation of renewable heat and Feed In Tariffs.	Amend para 6.4 to refer to grant funding.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A243	Housing should be provided to environmental performance standards in line with the prevailing building regulations, not in excess of them. Concern expressed about the deliverability of code for sustainable homes standards	115	445	<p>The site should deliver environmental performance to an agreed specification: Current & planned government requirements, as set out in the SPD, relate to performance against the code for sustainable homes. Financial & design allowances will need to be built into the development to accommodate these requirements throughout its lifetime. The Council is keen to ensure that, once having negotiated other requirements such as community infrastructure, open space & transport contributions in light of the financial allowances related to anticipated mandatory environmental performance, the benefits associated with the aforementioned financial allowances are not lost should the government decide to rescind the mandatory roll-out of the code for sustainable homes. This is particularly important given the sites Urban Eco-Settlement status. Higher standards will be sought where it is financially viable to do so. The ability to achieve environmental performance at anticipated cost levels is reliant on economic efficiencies from nationwide take-up of the technologies.</p>	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
244	SPD outlines that site has potential to support a district heating system. Text should allow for appropriate technologies based on viability and prevailing technologies as the site is brought forward	115	446	Since the SPD was drafted work has been undertaken on a Local Carbon Framework for York Northwest. The text should be amended to refer to this study and the conclusions of this for application of renewable energy systems within the site. Para 6.6 also states that the planning application will need to be flexible to respond to opportunities to implement or retrofit known future technologies and approaches. The wording could be changed to delete 'known' which would be more flexible.	Amend text in para 6.6 to refer to the Local Carbon Framework for York Northwest and delete 'known' reference to future technologies and approaches.
Statement 9: Urban Eco Settlement					
A245	Lack of clarity over what will be delivered through UES status	114	408	Opportunities for funding through the status of the York Northwest area as an UES will be taken. However as stated in the draft SPD there is no certainty over the type or level of long term funding which may become available.	No Change
A246	More appropriate for demonstration exemplar to act as an aspirational target for later stages of development rather than a benchmark	115	447	The delivery of the demonstration exemplar is subject to the availability of funding. There have been changes to the funding context and should opportunities arise to pursue this concept these will be pursued. This should be reflected in para 4.7	Amend text in para 4.7 to reflect the change in funding context.
A247	Clarification needed on whether buildings will be ecologically sound/zero carbon.	138	638	Statement 8 requires the development to minimise its environmental impact over its lifetime within the overarching principle of highest achievable standards of sustainability in Principle 4. The Code Level 6 zero carbon requirement for new residential buildings will be in place in 2016.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A248	This should be amended to read 'Regardless of any UES funding' and include highest standards throughout the site. Higher standards 'in key areas' (para 6.8) should be omitted. References to special/public funding is not appropriate as this is the responsibility of the developer.	135	603	The responsibility of the developer would be to meet the statutory Code Levels applicable at the time. Higher standards will be sought through negotiation on the application.	No Change
A249	Support promotion of site as an Urban Eco Settlement and the demonstration scheme.	132	582	Noted	No Change
A250	Support for site to be an Urban Eco Settlement.	135	590	Noted	No Change
Principle 5: To create a high quality locally distinctive place which relates well to the surrounding area					
A251	Clarification needed on 'locally distinctive place' and 'fits in with surrounding area'	63	181	Proposals will need to make reference to the six principle characteristics of the special character of York outlined in the Heritage Topic paper and the character of the surrounding residential areas.	No Change
A252	Houses and buildings should be of the highest design standards (avoiding standard design quality) and how this will be achieved should be outlined	67	213	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A253	Development of the site needs to relate well to the city eg, tall structures could be seen across wide area of city and impact on setting of historic assets. Suggest amendment to principle 'which relates well to both the surrounding area and the city as a whole'.	75	229	Noted. Principle 5 could be amended to include this.	Amend Principle 5 to include reference to the city as a whole.
A254	This principle is crucial with high quality integrated architectural design well designed layout (and public scrutiny before start of work)	85	262	Noted	No Change
Statement 10: High quality of design with distinctive character areas					
A255	Should place greater emphasis on need to design out crime	31	105	The draft SPD does make reference to the need to the need for the development to be designed to ensure a safe and secure environment in Principle 6. This will be considered and addressed in the detailed design of the development.	No Change
		43	128		
A256	Ensure architectural design and materials are high quality	85	265	Noted	No Change
A257	Suggest community project competition to attract competing designs	85	266	Different designs relating to different character areas within the development will be encouraged.	Forward comment on to the landowner
A258	National Grid supports high quality and well planned development in the vicinity of its high voltage overhead lines, with appropriate uses including nature conservation, open space , landscaping or parking	88	275	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A259	Not enough information on layout		296	Detailed proposals on the layout of the development will be addressed at the reserved matters stage. Illustrative layout plans will be sought as part of the outline planning application.	No Change
A260	Amenity impact issues on adjoining housing should be considered in locating open space eg, through noise nuisance. Areas of open space should be provided throughout site	210	824	Reference is made within Statement 10 to the need for the layout to take account of the amenities of adjoining occupiers. Principle 7 outlines the need for a framework of green infrastructure to be provided throughout the development.	No Change
A261	Concern about the appearance of eco-housing and the ability to be sympathetic to existing housing within the area	212	841	The statement refers to the need for high quality design and the need to reflect the context of the area. The consideration of the detailed design of dwellings will need to address these issues.	No Change
A262	The site does not have a connection with the river and although there is currently research to consider a potential linkage this does not form part of the draft masterplan.	115	448	The text relates to a visual rather than a physical connection (notwithstanding the potential for physical connection discussed at Statement 9)	No Change
A263	The SPD is too prescriptive to require noise exposure assessment, this is an issue that will be considered by part of the Environmental Impact Assessment.	115	449	Noise and vibration are relevant planning considerations and it is considered appropriate that reference is made to these issues in the draft SPD.	No Change
Statement 12: Key views into, out of and through the area					
A264	Development should not detract from the skyline viewed from Clifton Ings	2	1	Reference is made to the views to and from Clifton Ings, together with other key views.	No Change
A265	Landscaping should be used to frame new views	33	108	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A266	Need to consider and retain existing views of Minster and consider opportunities for new views.	123	551	Reference is made to opportunities for new key focal points and existing views of the Minster.	No Change
Principle 6: To create a people friendly environment which promotes opportunities for social and community interaction					
A267	Agree with principle	63	179	Noted	No Change
A268	Layout should extend existing roads that border site rather than creating a separate community	86	267	Integration and connectivity with the existing surrounding communities will be essential to ensure there is interaction within the community. These issues will be considered as part of the masterplanning stage of work.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A269	Should provide safe routes between housing and community facilities that minimise conflict with vehicular traffic	153	687	Text at para 6.23 already refers to safe routes to be provided between homes and community facilities although additional reference could be made to minimising conflict with vehicular traffic.	Amend para 6.23
A270	No reference to 'designing out crime' in para 6.19 or in sections on objectives/masterplanning layout.	135	604	Reference could be made in para 6.20 to incorporating designing out crime principles in the design of the development.	Amend para 6.20
A271	The design and building of this development should take into account safety and security issues.	124	556	Reference could be made in para 6.20 to incorporating designing out crime principles in the design of the development.	Amend para 6.20
A272	Need to consider antisocial aspects of providing open space to ensure this does not occur	206	797	Para 6.22 does refer to paths being well lit and subject to natural surveillance. Surveillance by residents of areas of open space deter antisocial behaviour and will need to be considered in the design and layout of the scheme.	To note in further stages of the planning process
Statement 13: Framework of linked public realm with pedestrian/ cycle priority					
A273	Open spaces should be designed to discourage any anti-social behaviour and vandalism	27	68	Noted. The detailed nature of the design and provision of any open space will be developed as part of the planning application and in subsequent stages of the scheme.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
		220	881		
		27	84		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A274	Suitable lighting should be part of design for new areas of open space and to avoid deterioration over time and areas being the focus of antisocial behaviour	216	860	Noted. The detailed nature of the design and provision of any open space will be developed as part of the planning application and in subsequent stages of the scheme.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A275	The integration of segregated pedestrian and cycle links with green infrastructure is welcomed	64	202	Noted	No Change
A276	Wherever possible' should be deleted from the reference to provision/segregation of pedestrian/cycle paths.	135	605	Segregation of pedestrian/cycle ways will be sought. However, there may be circumstances where this is not appropriate.	No Change
A277	Need to consider street lighting, parking and pedestrians and avoid problems experienced at Sovereign Park	208	811	Noted. The detailed nature of the design of public areas will be developed as part of the planning application and in the subsequent stages of the scheme.	To note comments in further stages of the planning of the development.
A278	Concern at safety issues with children playing on local estate roads, eg, Ouseacres	220	879	Safety issues are referred to in this statement and will be addressed in the design of the area in subsequent stages of the planning process.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
Statement 14: Multifunctional community spaces and facilities					
A279	Opportunity to locate football clubs on the site should be taken due to potential for rail access and park and ride sites with bus service	76	232	The type and use of sports facilities will be discussed as part of the management of the facilities in later stages of the planning process.	To note comments in further stages of the planning of the development.
A280	Support community halls being multifunctional	115	450	Noted.	No Change
Principle 7: To deliver development in a framework of linked multifunctional green infrastructure incorporating existing landscape areas and biodiversity value and maximising linkages with the wider green network					
A281	Welcome recognition of significant green infrastructure being a top priority.	135	606	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A282	A landscape strategy and tree planting must be developed together with maintenance and management from the outset. Local environmental and community groups should be involved in formulating this strategy.	135	607	A green infrastructure strategy will be required as part of a planning application which will be subject to public consultation.	No Change
A283	Support principle/approach to open	123	533	Noted	No Change
		196	756		
		197	760		
		200	776		
		201	778		
		207	806		
		210	823		
		211	830		
		212	836		
		215	855		
		218	870		
		219	876		
		220	880		
223	889				
A284	Disagree with approach to open space	195 202 199 208 206	753 783 768 814 796	Noted. Specific open space issues identified in consultation, as outlined in the officer recommendations will be addressed through the masterplanning process.	No Change
Statement 15: Green Infrastructure					
A285	Provision of open space in a new residential environment is important	11	24	Noted	No Change
		15	37		
		18	51		
		23	65		
		81	250		
		48	139		
		86	269		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
		207	807		
A286	Green spaces and waterways are vital	153	688	Noted	No Change
A287	Amount of open space should be maximised	154	693	Reference could be made in para 6.27 and 6.28 to ensure that consideration is given in the first instance to the presumption that all open space typologies should be provided within the site and ensure there is no overall loss of open space	Amend para 6.27 and 6.28
A289	Need parks	14	23	Noted	To note in further stages of the planning process.
		21	60		
		20	53		
		149	669		
		153	671		
A290	Need safe play areas	14	23	Noted	To note in further stages of the planning process.
		21	60		
		30	100		
		13	30		
		151	679		
		154	694		
		122	532		
A291	Need areas for dog walking	14	23	Informal areas of open space will be sought as part of the development within areas of natural/semi natural open space.	To note in further stages of the planning process.
		21	60		
A292	Need an open space warden	14	23	The management of open space areas will be discussed at later stages of the planning process.	To note in further stages of the planning process.
		21	63		
A293	Need outdoor sports provision	20	53	Areas of outdoor sports provision will be sought as part of the development.	To note in further stages of the planning process.
		34	113		
		13	30		
		111	384		
A294	Need bowling greens	111	386	The type and use of sports facilities will be discussed as part of the management of the facilities in later stages of the planning process.	To note in further stages of the planning process.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A295	Need community football pitches	108	365	The type and use of sports facilities will be discussed as part of the management of the facilities in later stages of the planning process.	To note in further stages of the planning process.
		151	677		
A296	Need provision for teenagers	34	113	The need to provide facilities for teenagers is outlined in para 6.28.	No Change
A297	Request provision of a skate park is made within the site	92	286	The type and use of park facilities will be discussed as part of the management of the facilities in later stages of the planning process.	To note in further stages of the planning process.
A298	Support allotments	153	690	Noted	No Change
		212	844		
A299	Need amenity space between buildings	21	60	Amenity space is a type of open space which will be sought as part of the development.	To note in further stages of the planning process.
A300	Need new tree planting	29	94	Para 6.34 outlines the need for new tree planting to complement the retention of existing trees on site.	No Change
		107	349		
		149	670		
A301	Planting trees near the rail lines will block noise	100	310	Trees do not actually block noise but create a visual barrier. Mask of noise may occur due to noise from wind in leaves. There is already a belt of trees on the boundary with the railway, although additional planting could be considered as part of detailed design proposals.	No Change.
A302	Open spaces should be designed to discourage any anti-social behaviour and vandalism	27	68	Comments are noted, the detailed nature of the design and provision of any open space will be developed as part of the planning application and in subsequent stages of the scheme.	To note in further stages of the planning process.
		27	84		
		97	300		
		105	341		
A303	Open space should serve biodiversity interest	33	106	A Biodiversity Management Plan will be sought as part of the the planning application. This requirement is set out in Figure 19 and includes the retention, enhancement and provision of biodiverse habitats.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A304	Seating and ponds would add interest	33	109	Comments are noted, the detailed nature of the design and provision of any open space will be developed as part of the planning application and in subsequent stages of the scheme.	To note in further stages of the planning process.
A305	Need more information on the size and type of space to be provided	14	32	The design, size and type of open space provision will emerge through the masterplanning process and will be subject to public consultation.	No Change
		95	295		
A306	Open space for young people should be sited away from shops	20	57	The design, size and type of open space provision will emerge through the masterplanning process and will be subject to public consultation.	To note in further stages of the planning process.
A307	Open space needs to be segregated for different users/ activities eg children/ elderly/ dogs	29	95	The design, size and type of open space provision will emerge through the masterplanning process and will be subject to public consultation. Publically accessible areas should however be designed to facilitate inclusivity and community interaction and this is referred to in Principle 6.	No Change
A308	Insufficient detail on the scale of open space	51	148	The design, size and type of open space provision will emerge through the masterplanning process and will be subject to public consultation.	No Change
A309	Open space will be needed for old and new communities	58	167	Suggest text is amended in para 6.26 to highlight existing deficiencies in open space. This needs to be taken into account in assessing new provision within the new development. Access and intergration between the existing and new communities will be sought and the design of the development should facilitate both accessibility and use of open space. Suggest further clarification is given in para 6.27.	Amend paras 6.26 and 6.27
A310	Avoid snicketts which assist crime	63	182	The design of publically accessible areas should incorporate designing out crime principles.	See change to para 6.20

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A311	Unclear what formal recreation uses are envisaged	67	215	The type and use of formal recreation facilities will emerge through further stages of the planning process.	No Change
A312	Open space and landscaping is important rather than high density housing	80	248	Noted	No Change
A313	Ensure open spaces are well designed and managed after completion, funded by developers	85	264	Noted. The future management of open spaces is referred to in para 6.26 and will be sought for a 10 year period.	No Change
A314	Important to consider maintenance of open spaces	149	670	Noted. The future management of open spaces is referred to in para 6.26 and will be sought for a 10 year period.	No Change
A315	Play areas should be small and planned to discourage older children	86	269	The design, size and type of play area provision will emerge through the masterplanning process and will be subject to public consultation.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
A316	Need a pleasant attractive environment with trees and plants, consider opportunities to work with horticultural association	107	350	A detailed landscaping plan for each phase of development will be required as part of the reserved matters planning applications.	No Change
A317	Environmentally sensitive lighting will be required	151	677	The council is committed to responsible energy management and promoting the proportion of energy derived from renewable sources and reducing energy consumption and modernising street lighting operations.	No Change
A318	Promote off-site natural open space provision at Poppleton Ings	111	383	Para 6.28 does acknowledge that a degree of off-site provision may be acceptable This would be subject to such open space being accessible from the site.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A319	Consider there would be benefits in open space being multifunctional, eg in management	115	451	The York LDF evidence study does not take this approach. It uses set typologies to establish the current land holding pattern and assesment of future needs. The proposal would not accord with the study which Members have considered and endorsed, and has also been used and successfully defended in planning appeals. The draft SPD does support the broad principle of providing multifunctional areas of green infrastructure, though when quantifying provision against the targets, land can only constitute a single open space typology.	No Change
A320	Do not agree that off site provision may be more acceptable for natural/semi natural open space.	135	608	The typologies of natural/semi natural open space and outdoor sports are referred to in the context of off-site provision due to the nature and scale of such open space. However, provision of this type of open space would also be required on site. The Open Space Topic Paper refers to on site provision being required to ensure a balanced scheme.	No Change
A321	Significant provision needed for leisure facilities and public open space due to current deficiencies.	124	554	Suggest text is amended in para 6.26 to highlight existing deficiencies in open space. This needs to be taken into account in assessing new provision within the new development. Access and integration between the existing and new communities will need to be provided and the design of the development should facilitate both accessibility and use of open space. Suggest further clarification is also given in para 6.27 and 6.28.	Amend para 6.26, 6.27 and 6.28
A322	Clarification needed on the level of sporting facilities proposed and facilities should include football and cricket.	125	558	The text at 3.1 could be amended to be more specific in terms of the existing outdoor sport provision. The type of sporting provision will emerge through the masterplanning process and will be subject to public consultation.	Amend para 3.1

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A323	Development should have high standards of green open spaces.	125	560	Noted	No Change
A324	Open space should include areas of bio-diversity rather than extensive areas of grass	223	897	A Biodiversity Management Plan will be sought as part of the the planning application. This requirement is set out in Figure 19 and includes the retention, enhancement and provision of biodiverse habitats.	No Change
A325	Location and type of facilities to be provided depends on what is provided and future effectiveness in terms of investment (by council/tax payers)	215	856	The location and type of open space provision will emerge through the masterplanning process and will be subject to public consultation. The future management of open spaces is referred to in para 6.26 and will be sought for a 10 year period.	No Change
Statement 16: Green Spine					
A326	Clifton Ings is of significant interest in respect of its wild flower and wildlife interest- its appearance needs to be protected.	2	2	Noted. Clifton Ings is designated as a SINC (Site 14,2010) for species rich flood meadow grassland. Its interest as a SINC will ensure its wildlife value will be protected.	No Change
A327	Green corridor should be designed throughout the site and link with existing green space where possible	17	47	This statement refers to the creation of a green spine (green corridor) with links to new and existing green assets.	No Change
A328	Green corridor should provide for wildlife and cycling/walking routes and be of sufficient width to accommodate these	52	152	Para 6.29 outlines the need for green routes through the site to allow connectivity for both people and wildlife.	No Change
A329	Welcome proposal for green spine to link with regional and local green corridors	64	198	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A330	It is misleading to suggest that green infrastructure within the site will link with existing corridors (Figure 11)	115	452	The text states that the masterplan should demonstrate how the green spine will link with and incorporate these corridors. The intention is to ensure that where connections can be made with green corridors this opportunity is taken. Connection does not necessarily need physically contiguous sites.	No Change
A331	Green Infrastructure should be provided in such a manner as would make it accessible to existing residents of Acomb	152	683	Noted	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A332	The development must include a pedestrian bridge over the railway onto Rawcliffe/Clifton Ings to give access to open space and pedestrian/cycle routes.	135	609	Figure 18 does include a potential pedestrian and cycle link to the north-east of the railway lines. Para 7.16 also outlines that provision of this linkage should be investigated. Text at para 7.16 could be amended to outline the intention to provide an east-west bridge together with a link to Water End, outline the need for contributions towards the provision of this subject to further deliverability issues, dedicate land within the site and ensure that future provision of a link is not prejudiced by the design of the development. Off site provision of open space and any supporting infrastructure requirements will be dependent on scheme design and viability appraisal.	Amend 7.16

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A333	Blue infrastructure (including SUDS) can complement green infrastructure and corridors.	132	583	Noted. Para 6.29 does refer to blue infrastructure, including SUDS to be included where appropriate.	No Change
Statement 17: Retention of existing green assets					
A334	The former Manor School playing fields should be retained as open space/sports field	9	14	Para 6.31 outlines that the approach for the former playing fields will be informed by a playing pitch assessment and advice from Sport England.	No Change
		10	16		
		27	69		
		38	120		
		63	192		
		87	273		
		58	166		
		102	318		
		103	323		
		108	360		
		109	375		
		152	685		
		124	552		
117	501				
A335	Craven sports field should be retained	109	375	The presumption in the LDF is to retain such facilities to ensure there is an adequate supply of playing fields. Sport England will also be consulted should any proposal be made which affects the sports field on the British Sugar site.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A336	The playing fields are used by community football clubs who will be displaced to commercially run facilities	208	815	Para 6.31 outlines that the approach for the former playing fields will be informed by playing pitch assessment and advice from Sport England.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A337	The former civil service sports ground should be used in some way	108	361	The former Civil Service Sports Ground is in different ownership to the British Sugar site. Access to the site is outlined as a potential all vehicular access but inclusion of this option will depend on the proposals to meet the requirements of the SPD put forward by the developer of the site.	No Change
A338	All established trees should be retained	10	17	There is a presumption that good quality or trees of amenity/landscape vaule will be retained in para 6.34. Para 6.33 could be amended to outline the intention to TPO suitable trees.	Amend para 6.33
		27	83		
A339	Retain all trees where possible	111	389	Noted. There is a presumption that good quality or trees of amenity/landscape vaule will be retained in para 6.34. Para 6.33 could be amended to outline the intention to TPO suitable trees.	Amend para 6.33
		121	528		
A340	No trees should be lost	108	356	There is a presumption that good quality or trees of amenity/landscape vaule will be retained in para 6.34. Para 6.33 could be amended to outline the intention to TPO suitable trees.	Amend para 6.33
A341	Retain trees at Manor School	38	120	There is a presumption that good quality or trees of amenity/landscape vaule will be retained in para 6.34. Para 6.33 could be amended to outline the intention to TPO suitable trees.	Amend para 6.33
		43	128		
		63	184		
		77	237		
		99	307		
		103	324		
		109	372		
118	506				

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A342	Essential to keep existing trees on the old Manor school site fronting the A59 due to age, wildlife and amenity provided	83	257	There is a presumption that good quality or trees of amenity/landscape value will be retained in para 6.34. Para 6.33 could be amended to outline the intention to TPO suitable trees.	Amend para 6.33
		93	289		
A343	Retention and enhancement of trees should be acknowledged as being a matter for consideration as part of the masterplanning process	115	454	The retention of trees is covered by Statement 17 as existing green assets of value. The impact of the development on existing green assets will be a material consideration in any planning application and will be considered within the masterplanning process. Para 6.33 could be amended to outline the intention to TPO suitable trees.	Amend para 6.33
A344	The plan is somewhat unclear and is out of date and should be replaced	115	455	The plan will be reproduced to provide greater clarity. The plan is based on evidence base study work.	Amend Figure 14.
A345	Retain British Sugar lagoons to provide variety and foster biodiversity	16	41	The lagoons on the site were previously used as settlement/filtering beds. An Environmental Statement will be required as part of the planning application which will highlight all areas of existing biodiversity and new areas to be provided as part of the development.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A346	Only the former Manor School footprint should be built on	27	70	The presumption in the LDF is to retain sports facilities to ensure there is an adequate supply of playing fields. Sport England will also be consulted should any proposal be made which affects the sports fields. The part of the site occupied by the former Manor School buildings has been identified through the LDF as a housing site. The spatial distribution of uses within the site will emerge through the masterplanning and planning process.	No Change.
A347	Support retention of trees and bunding, particularly adjacent to Langholme Drive which provide a roosting area for bats	63	183	Noted. The presence of bats will need to be investigated as part of the supporting evidence for the planning application. Reference to this could be included in the documents outlined in Figure 19 as necessary to support an application.	Comments to be passed onto the landowner. Amend Figure 19 to include reference to assessment of protected species as part of ecological information .
		84	261		
A348	Important to retain existing trees and green areas eg rear of Langholme Drive which provide a wildlife habitat for birds/butterflies/rabbits and foxes	80	249	There is a presumption to retain existing trees identified as being of value. Para 6.33 outlines this and in para 6.34 the wildlife value of trees is also recognised.	No Change
A349	Trees along the boundary with Sovereign Park should be retained	208	817	Para 6.33 outlines the presumption to retain existing trees identified as being of value and to enhance these where they would benefit the amenities of adjoining residential areas.	No Change
A350	Support retention of existing biodiversity features including SINC	64	199	Noted	No Change
		111	382		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A351	The bee bank should be referred to as a "Candidate SINC" given its status and the requirement for foraging area assessment	115	453	The SINC site has now been confirmed and foraging surveys will be required in order to determine the impact of any development on this SINC and appropriate mitigation and management strategies.	No Change
A352	Support retention of greenspace between site and Poppleton, which prevents the coalescence of Poppleton and York	155	696	The policy approach to land uses outside the site will be addressed through the emerging Core Strategy and LDF.	No Change
A353	Clearer presentation of Figure 14 is needed within final document	64	200	Noted. This will be addressed in the final version of the document.	Amend Figure 14 to provide greater clarity.
A354	A major nature reserve should be identified along the north eastern boundary, to include the Bee bank and to be managed by community groups	135	610	Natural and semi natural open space should be provided as part of the development. The bee bank is identified as a Site of Importance for Nature Conservation. The provision of a nature reserve and management by community groups could be considered as part of the masterplanning work and would also depend on a group being interested in managing this. The spatial arrangement of uses within the site will also be considered as part of the masterplanning work.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A355	The masterplanning should be informed by a finalised tree strategy.	135	611	Noted. Para 6.34 could be amended to refer to the emerging Tree Strategy for York. Figure 19 could be amended to add reference to the need for a Tree Survey to be carried out	Amend para 6.34. Add reference to Tree Survey in Figure 19

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A356	Clarification required as to whether open space includes present playing fields on old Manor School site.	130	575	The presumption in the LDF is to retain sports facilities to ensure there is an adequate supply of playing fields. Sport England will also be consulted should any proposal be made which affects the sports fields. The part of the site occupied by the former Manor School buildings has been identified through the LDF as a housing site. The spatial distribution of uses within the site will emerge through the masterplanning and planning process.	No Change
A357	The SINC designation will provide habitat protection and connectivity through the development is well thought out	52	151	Noted	No Change
A360	Very concerned about potential removal of chestnut trees.	125	559	Trees will be assessed and there will be a presumption to retain those which are considered to be of quality and value. This is set out in para 6.34 of the draft SPD.	No Change
A361	Existing sports field at British Sugar should be used for a community sports facility/social club.	121	529	The presumption in the LDF is to retain sports facilities to ensure there is an adequate supply of playing fields. Sport England will also be consulted should any proposal be made which affects the sports fields. The spatial distribution of uses within the site will emerge through the masterplanning and planning process.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A362	Retain open space around old Manor School to provide integration with existing development which is lacking this type of provision.	123	534	The spatial distribution of open space within the site will emerge through the masterplanning and planning process. There is a presumption to retain existing green assets in the LDF.	No Change
A363	Retain wildlife area within development site.	123	535	Natural and semi natural open space should be provided as part of the development. The bee bank is identified as a Site of Importance for Nature Conservation.	No Change
A364	Object to loss of cricket ground and sports field for access purposes	199	769	The options available to enable redevelopment of this brownfield site are limited to those outlined in the draft SPD. Whilst there may be implications arising from the provision of new access routes on open space and recreational facilities within the site these will need to be balanced against the benefits provided and the design of any new development will seek to minimise the impact on such facilities and seek re-provision where appropriate.	No Change
A365	Existing/raised land features should remain to give scheme some variety.			Noted	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A366	Manor school site is an important green space which should be retained. The loss of this highly visible green space would be detrimental to the character and appearance of the area	203	788	The spatial distribution of open space within the site will emerge through the masterplanning and planning process. There is a presumption to retain existing green assets in the LDF.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A367	The Manor School site should remain as green space, possibly as park area	203	789	The spatial distribution of open space within the site will emerge through the masterplanning and planning process. There is a presumption to retain existing green assets in the LDF.	No Change
Principle 8: To maximise integration, connectivity and accessibility to and from the site giving priority to sustainable travel in line with the hierarchy of users set out in the LTP2 and emerging LTP3					
A368	Proposals have merit	13	26	Noted	No Change
A369	Achievement of Principle is doubtful	79	242	The principle sets out the objective. Achievement of this will be subject to further work on potential routes and negotiation on delivery. The aim to give priority to sustainable travel accords with the council approach to transport issues set out in the LDF and LTP3.	No Change
		106	343		
A370	Principles can only be agreed once road access to York Station is improved due to congestion issues on this route.	142	645	Network improvements will be sought where possible providing they relate to the development and the trips generated by development of this site. The principle of maximising sustainable travel is aimed at reducing vehicle movements on the network.	No Change
A371	current public transport provision is poor which transfers trips to be made by car	214	849	The aim will be to ensure public transport provision is made for the new occupiers of the development which provides an alternative to the car.	No Change
Statement 18: New routes between site and key destinations					
General					
A372	Concern about congestion on key routes	49	142	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation, as well as reducing the level of traffic	Amend para 7.38
		15	36		
		46	130		
		140	641		
		104	336		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
		199	767	generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. This is reflected in the Transport Statements set out in Section 7 the draft SPD. Reference could be made in para 7.38 to ensure ongoing monitoring and review is undertaken and to ensure traffic is satisfactorily accommodated as the development is built out with appropriate financial arrangements included within the Travel Plan.	
A373	Disagree with access approach	195 199 203 206 207 208 212 215 217	752 766 784 794 803 812 842 853 863	The access points referred to in Figure 17 outline potential new links to the site. A single access will not be sufficient to satisfactorily access the site and it is likely that a combination of different access points will be required, some being essential and some being desirable.	No Change
A374	Agree with access approach	196 197 201 202 210 212 219 223	755 758 777 782 821 835 875 887	Noted	No Change
A375	Limited access should be as limited as possible	7	7	The restrictions on levels of development served by an access will depend on various factors including the capacity of the road to accommodate movements and the width and type of road and the junction arrangements. The text could be amended to clarify the term 'restricted'.	Amend para 7.14

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A376	There aren't enough access points	34	112	Potential access points into the site are limited due to existing development around the site and the railway lines.	No Change
A377	There should be access at the far east and west of the site	38	117	It is unclear where access to the west is being suggested. Access to the east is limited by the location of the railway line and the cost of an all vehicular access across the railway.	No Change
A378	Need to consider access to and from the river corridor	26	66	Provision of a route over the railway has been the subject of further investigative work and it is suggested in para 7.16 that this is incorporated into the pedestrian/cycle access to the site.	No Change
		38	118		
A379	Support 3 points of access onto boroughbridge road	12	25	Noted.	No Change
A380	More than 2 points of access will be required	147	665	Noted	No Change
A381	Clarification needed on the options	11	22	Further clarification on the access arrangements will be addressed as part of the masterplanning work and be subject to consultation.	No Change
		28	86		
		51	147		
		102	320		
A382	Insufficient thought given to main priority of access	27	71	Para 7.13 outlines that the principal vehicular access should be via Millfield Lane. This guidance is based on the outcomes of transport modelling and an assessment of impact on the surrounding transport network.	No Change
A383	Three unrestricted access points don't have spare capacity to integrate vehicles from the development	27	76	Two unrestricted all vehicular access points are outlined in the vehicular access options. The capacity of existing roads and a new access to A59 to accommodate the traffic movements from the proposed development will be assessed from the Transport Assessment.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A384	Traffic lights in close proximity to one-another will exacerbate congestion	27	78	Traffic lights are an important tool in managing traffic flows although their use will need to be carefully considered in terms of congestion and impact on the wider network.	No Change
		93	288		
		155	697		
A385	Ability to access the site should be shared between all access points	27	79	Two unrestricted all vehicular access points are outlined in the vehicular access options. The capacity of existing roads and a new access to A59 to accommodate the traffic movements from the proposed development will be assessed from the Transport Assessment.	No Change
A386	Clarification needed on whether a linkage is provided to the inner ring road and the York Central site	65	210	The timing of the York Central development will most likely preclude a linkage being provided in the short term. In the longer term, a route through to York Central via Boroughbridge Road is likely to be supported, although this will not provide connectivity with the inner ring road as the objective will be to restrict new vehicular access points into the city centre.	No Change
A387	A number of access options are needed	66	211	Noted	No Change
A389	Should investigate whether alternative access could be achieved.	131	577	Potential access points into the site are limited due to existing development around the site and the railway lines.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A390	Directing all the traffic from the development onto two roads is 'crazy' as this may equate to an additional 2,000 cars a day	71	224	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. Maintaining the safety and efficiency of the network will be a central part of this mitigation. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	No Change
A391	Access routes must minimise impact of traffic on surrounding residential area	83	255	This brownfield site is located within a residential area. It is inevitable that the development of the area will generate additional traffic movements in the area. However, the approach taken within the draft SPD is to facilitate sustainable travel and thereby seek to minimise impact of traffic movements on the area. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	No Change
A392	Transport links between the site and A1237 across railway line and York Central should be considered to ease congestion on A59	87	272	Transport modelling on the impact of development on the surrounding road network with the provision of a new route between York Central and the A1237 has been undertaken. This demonstrated that there would be limited time benefits and significant redistribution of existing traffic onto a new route whilst the significant costs of this would be unlikely to be deliverable through the development.	No Change
A393	Clearly defined and easy access to properties for emergency services is required	97	299	Accessibility for emergency vehicles will be addressed in the detailed design of the area.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A394	Link road to station is not mentioned	77	236	Transport modelling on the impact of development on the surrounding road network with the provision of a new route between York Central and the A1237 has been undertaken. This demonstrated that there would be limited time benefits and significant redistribution of existing traffic onto a new route whilst the significant costs of this would be unlikely to be deliverable through the development.	No Change
A395	Traffic needs to be considered in conjunction with A59 Park and Ride	107	348	The Poppleton Park and Ride service will be directed to providing a fast and efficient service between the P and R site and the city centre. There would be significant time disbenefits of routing this service through the site. The overall mitigation package of transport measures will be expected to take account of emerging proposals, including those anticipated through the A59 P and R. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	No Change
A396	It is inappropriate to define "principal" points of access at this stage	115	456	Paragraph 7.13 makes reference to modelling work which was undertaken on the basis of Millfield Lane forming a principal access. This modelling assumption does not preclude an alternative approach to the sites development being undertaken.	No Change
A397	Essential that vehicular access provided via Low Poppleton Lane to Boroughbridge Road	139	639	The suitability of the existing access to the former Manor School site from Low Poppleton Lane will be considered as part of the package of vehicular access options for the area. This will need to be informed by micro-simulation modelling.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A398	Restricting car access via Plantation Drive and Ouseacres is unenforceable.	134	614	The restricted access options for Plantation Drive and Ouse Acres set out in the draft SPD envisage limitations on their use through the design of the development. Thus, for example, vehicular access for private vehicles would only be possible to a limited number of dwellings.	No Change
A399	Traffic problems will occur, despite extension to 1237 roundabout and park and ride.	134	587	The implications of additional vehicle movements on the network will be carefully assessed and will be expected to be satisfactorily mitigated by the developer through a phased scheme of network improvements, as set out at Statement 23 of the draft SPD	No Change
A400	Boroughbridge Road is already a heavily used route and 4 of 5 access routes would link onto this. Should look for other access to site.	129	572	Potential access points into the site are limited due to existing development around the site and the railway lines.	No Change
A401	Should provide new road along railway line into York	199	772	Transport modelling on the impact of development on the surrounding road network with the provision of a new route between York Central and the A1237 has been undertaken. This demonstrated that there would be limited time benefits and significant redistribution of existing traffic onto a new route whilst the significant costs of this would be unlikely to be deliverable through the development.	No Change
A402	Main access should be via Milfield Lane together with Plantation Drive and Low Poppleton Lane	203	786	Two unrestricted all vehicular access points are outlined in the vehicular access options. The capacity of existing roads and a new access to A59 to accommodate the traffic movements from the proposed development will be assessed from the Transport Assessment.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A403	Congestion on the ring road to access A64 due to volume of traffic from Clifton Moor	214	850	Upgrading of the Outer Ring road has been considered as part of the improvements necessitated through the York Northwest development as a whole, and it is likely that the British Sugar development will have to contribute to these works, alongside other developments and public funding. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	No Change
A404	Disagree with this if restricted access means residents only but agree if a vehicle weight limit	215	854	The restricted access options for Plantation Drive and Ouse Acres set out in the draft SPD envisage limitations on their use through the design of the development. Thus, for example, vehicular access for private vehicles would only be possible to a limited number of dwellings.	No Change
A405	Some movement between A1237 and A59 through the site will be required. Measures such as a rising bollard/staffed barrier/ANPR should be considered to facilitate this. However rat running by general public should be avoided	217	865	The movement strategy for the site should facilitate access into and out of the site for users/residents of the area. Potential for rat running by vehicles should be avoided and addressed in the design of the movement strategy.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A406	Clarification required on the term restricted access, ie, emergency vehicles only or restricted areas within the development	218	869		
		210	822	The restricted access options for Plantation Drive and Ouse Acres set out in the draft SPD envisage limitations on their use through the design of the development. Thus, for example, vehicular access for private vehicles would only be possible to a limited number of dwellings.	See revised para 7.14
Millfield Lane					
A407	Millfield Lane access should not be restricted by barriers	8	9	The rising bollards at the junction of Milfield Lane and Low Poppleton Lane were installed to restrict rat running movements between the outer ring road and Boroughbridge Road. This would occur if these restrictions were removed.	No Change
A408	Access via Millfield Lane is preferable - too much emphasis on A59	18	50	The proportion of trips served by each access will be determined following detailed modelling work once the scale and mix of the development is sufficiently developed.	No Change
		43	126		
A409	Too much reliance placed on Millfield Lane access	116	473	The proportion of trips served by each access will be determined following detailed modelling work once the scale and mix of the development is sufficiently developed.	No Change
A410	Object to Millfield Lane access	113	400	Two unrestricted all vehicular access points, including Milfield Lane, are outlined in the vehicular access options. The capacity of existing roads and a new access to A59 to accommodate the traffic movements from the proposed development will be assessed from the Transport Assessment.	No Change
		136	628		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A411	Conflict with access and Manor school	49	143	Issues arising from the location of the school on Milfield Lane will need to be addressed in the Transport Assessment and package of mitigation/infrastructure improvements proposed.	No Change
		136	626		
		116	475		
		157	707		
A412	Conflict between increasing vehicle movements and existing traffic calming measures	116	474	Traffic calming both within the site and those existing measures in the surrounding area will be an important component of the transport package. This will need to ensure a satisfactory balance is achieved between accessibility and impact on the environment and network.	No Change
A413	Conflict between increasing vehicle movements and use as a main bus route	157	706	The frequency and routing of bus services is a key issue, and any necessary improvements will form a component part of the sites transport package, as required by Statement 19 of the draft SPD.	No Change
A414	Propose rejoining Millfield Lane and Low Poppleton Lane to vehicular traffic	109	373	The rising bollards at the junction of Milfield Lane and Low Poppleton Lane were installed to restrict rat running movements between the outer ring road and Boroughbridge Road. This would occur if these restrictions were removed.	No Change
		146	661		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A415	Concern about impact on York Business Park roundabout of using Millfield Lane for access	111	393	Improvements to the local highway network will be an essential component of mitigating the impact of the development, as set out in Statement 23 of the draft SPD. Junction improvements at York Business Park roundabout will be considered as part of this mitigation package	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A416	Concern about impact on the Harrogate line rail crossing of using Millfield Lane for access	112	395	The impact of additional traffic on Millfield Lane level crossing will be an important consideration. Initial discussions with Network Rail have revealed that this impact can be technically mitigated, however, there are cost implications - this will be required as part of any detailed planning application	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
		113	398		
		144	650		
		116	476		
		157	708		
A417	Develpers need to address impact of development on level crossing and asset protection issues and this should be considered in masterplanning the site	221	883	The impact of additional traffic on Millfield Lane level crossing will be an important consideration. Initial discussions with Network Rail have revealed that this impact can technically be mitigated, however there are cost implications - this will be required as part of any detailed planning application.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A418	Concern about impact on Manor School of using Millfield Lane for access	112	396	Issues arising from the impact of the development on Manor school in Milfield Lane will need to be addressed in the Transport Assessment and package of mitigation/infrastructure improvements proposed.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
		113	399		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A419	Conflict with children crossing level crossing and commercial vehicles using Millfield Lane	137	631	The package of transport measures/improvements proposed will need to satisfactorily address safety issues arising from the impact of the proposals.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A420	Use of Millfield Lane as a primary access will conflict with Poppleton Park and Ride proposals	156	701	The Poppleton Park and Ride service will be directed to providing a fast and efficient service between the P and R site and the city centre using A59. The overall mitigation package of transport measures will be expected to take account of emerging proposals, including those anticipated through the A59 P and R.	To be addressed in the Transport Assessment. To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A421	Concerned about use of Millfield Lane as primary access having an impact on Poppleton Village	156	702	The overall mitigation package of transport measures will need to ensure the effects of the development are minimised on surrounding residential areas by avoiding potential rat running through these areas and whilst ensuring local accessibility is provided for. The issue of potential additional traffic being routed through Poppleton village has been identified and will need to be addressed in the package of mitigation/infrastructure improvements proposed.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A422	Heavy reliance on Millfield Lane counter-intuitively forces city-bound traffic in the opposite direction	116	477	Transport modelling has demonstrated that by directing traffic movement to the A1237 it is likely to lead to a dispersion of traffic between the A59 and the A19 radial roads into York. Whilst this does lead to longer journeys it also results in less direct impact on the A59.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A423	Heavy Reliance on Millfield Lane forces traffic onto the congested outer ring road	116	478	Upgrading of the Outer Ring road has been considered as part of the improvements necessitated through the York Northwest development as a whole, and it is likely that the British Sugar development will have to contribute to these works, alongside other developments in the city. There is more potential to mitigate the effect of additional traffic on the outer ring road compared and use of radial routes into the city centre is the preferred strategy as opposed to affecting the adjoining local network through largely residential areas.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A424	Heavy reliance on Millfield Lane turns the development into a cul-de-sac	116	480	The access points referred to in Figure 17 outline potential new links to the site. A single access will not be sufficient to satisfactorily access the site and it is likely that a combination of different access points will be required, some being essential and others desirable.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A425	Unclear how site would be zoned to achieve 75% of trips using Millfield Lane	116	479	The proportion of trips served by each access will be determined following detailed modelling work once the scale and mix of the development is sufficiently developed. The design of the development will seek to control the use of each access option.	To be addressed in the Transport Assessment. To note in further stages of the planning process
A426	Clarification needed on access via Milfield Lane (eg question whether bollards to remain)	137	633	The access points referred to in Figure 17 outline potential new links to the site. A single access will not be sufficient to satisfactorily access the site and it is likely that a combination of different access points will be required, some being essential and others desirable. The rising bollards at the junction of Milfield Lane and Low Poppleton Lane were installed to restrict rat running and there are no plans to remove these.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A427	support use of Milfield Lane, upgraded if possible for light vehicles - heavy vehicles to use Poppleton Business Park access.	123	548	The access points referred to in Figure 17 outline potential new links to the site. A single access will not be sufficient to satisfactorily access the site and it is likely that a combination of different access points will be required, some being essential and others desirable.	No Change
A428	Construction traffic should use Milfield Lane	220	774	Restrictions on use of local roads by construction traffic due to impact on residential amenities is likely to be addressed in any detailed planning consent through conditions attached to planning permission.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A59					
A429	Concern about impact on A59 congestion	27	73	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. This is reflected in Statements 20 and 23 of the draft SPD.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
		28	87		
		99	306		
		100	309		
		77	238		
		103	325		
		106	346		
		107	347		
		108	357		
		109	369		
		147	664		
		148	667		
		130	573		
		117	497		
		220	878		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A430	Further access onto the A59 should be avoided	146	660	The access points referred to in Figure 17 outline potential new links to the site. A single access will not be sufficient to satisfactorily access the site and it is likely that a combination of different access points will be required, some being essential and others desirable.	No Change
A431	Concern about impact on air quality on A59	103	330	There is extensive monitoring of AQ on A59 Boroughbridge Road. Nitrogen Dioxide concentrations are currently below health based objectives in this area. AQ assessment will be carried out and must demonstrate no significant impact on AQ.	No Change
A432	Access to the A59 essential to avoid the congested outer ring road	9	13	The access points referred to in Figure 17 outline potential new links to the site. A single access will not be sufficient to satisfactorily access the site and it is likely that a combination of different access points will be required, some being essential and others desirable.	No Change
A433	Support new slip road into site from A59	20	56	Noted.	No Change
A434	Access to Boroughbridge Road still impact on Poppleton due to increased congestion on outer ring road.	137	636	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel.	To be addressed in the Transport Assessment. To note comments in further stages of the planning process

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A435	The A59 is already severely overloaded particularly at peak times	134	586	Existing levels of traffic through links and junctions on the surrounding network will be assessed as part of a planning application and the impact of additional traffic will need to be satisfactorily mitigated. This may necessitate improvements to the highway network together with a range of transport measures to control the flow of traffic within the area. Statement 23 sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan and Community Infrastructure Levy.	Amend text within para 7.37 to reflect the content of the YNW Transport Masterplan and CIL.
A436	Traffic should be limited/reduced on A59 due to current pressure at peak times	124	555	The A59 is a main radial route from the outer ring road to the city centre and as such is a main transport route within the councils transport strategy. As part of Access York there are proposals to undertake bus priority measures on the A59 to increase the efficiency and bus service provided on this route.	No Change
A437	Concern that Boroughbridge Road is already congested and additional traffic will make it intolerable.	121	527	Existing levels of traffic through links and junctions on the surrounding network will be assessed as part of a planning application and the impact of additional traffic will need to be satisfactorily mitigated. This may necessitate improvements to the highway network together with a range of transport measures to control the flow of traffic within the area. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A438	Likely to cause traffic chaos on Boroughbridge Road in the vicinity of Sovereign Park	208	813	Existing levels of traffic through links and junctions on the surrounding network will be assessed as part of a planning application and the impact of additional traffic will need to be satisfactorily mitigated. This may necessitate improvements to the highway network together with a range of transport measures to control the flow of traffic within the area. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these will need to be addressed in the Transport Assessment.	To be addressed in the Transport Assessment. To note comments in further stages of the planning process
Manor School Access					
A439	Access at the former Manor School will reduce conflict between traffic and pupils at the new Manor School	14	31	An access via the former Manor School site is one of two options for a new all vehicular route to the A59. A combination of different access points is outlined in figure 17 of the draft SPD in order to disperse the impact of additional traffic on the network.	No Change
A440	Object to vehicular access across former Manor School site	63	185	Potential access points into the site are limited due to existing development around the site and the railway lines. An access via the former Manor School site is one of two options for a new all vehicular route to the A59. A combination of different access points is outlined in Figure 17 in order to disperse the impact of additional traffic on the network.	No Change
		93	287		
		101	312		
		93	287		
		141	644		
		152	681		
		203	785		
A441	Vehicular access at the former Manor School will congest the A59	10	15	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel.	No Change
		99	308		
		152	682		
		118	505		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A442	Object to vehicular access at the former Manor School due to loss of trees	101	314	If the access option over the former Manor School site is pursued every effort should be made to minimise any impact on existing trees. The need to provide an access to the site will need to be carefully balanced against the impact on green infrastructure.	No Change
		117	500		
		116	483		
A443	Object to vehicular access at the former Manor School due to loss of open space	101	316	If the access option over the former Manor School site is pursued every effort should be made to minimise any impact on the remaining open space. The need to provide an access to the site will need to be carefully balanced against the impact on green infrastructure.	No Change
		104	335		
		109	375		
		116	483		
A444	Object to vehicular access at the former Manor School due to risk to school children	93	289	An new access proposals would need to ensure the safety of existing pedestrian users, including any crossings for school children.	No Change
A445	Object to vehicular access at the former Manor School due to residential disamenity	113	401	If the Manor school site access its pursued it will be important to minimise the environmental affects on adjoining residential areas, through retaining existing trees where possible and enhancing the landscape.	Amend para 7.13 to include reference to the need to assess the environmental impact of any new access on amenity.
		152	681		
A446	Object to Manor school access due to danger/ pollution/ disamenity to residents of Low Poppleton Lane and Millgates	152	682	Air Quality Monitoring on Low Poppleton Lane and Millgates indicate levels of nitrogen dioxide are currently well below health based objective levels. Air Quality assessment will be carried out and must demonstrate no significant impact on Air Quality.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A447	Object to Manor School access due to impact on properties fronting the A59 opposite who have drives onto the A59	116	482	Existing levels of traffic through links and junctions on the surrounding network will be assessed as part of a planning application and the impact of additional traffic will need to be satisfactorily mitigated. This may necessitate improvements to the highway network together with a range of transport measures to control the flow of traffic within the area. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	No Change
A448	Manor School access option should be via Low Poppleton lane or an A59 junction which is staggered from the existing Boroughbridge road junction	16	40	The location of any junction to A59 will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment.	No Change
		101	313		
A449	Using existing Lowfield Lane junction would avoid the loss of trees	103	326	As Lowfield Lane is some distance from the site it is unclear how this would relate to the site.	No Change
A450	Concerned about proximity of proposed access to A59/ Boroughbridge Road junction	117	499	The location of any junction to A59 will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment.	No Change
		116	481		
A451	Support Manor School access via Low Poppleton Lane	27	77	Noted	No Change
A452	Poppleton Lane should provide main access not options 1 or 2	83	256	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment.	No Change
A453	Support re-opening of Low Poppleton Lane	150	673	The rising bollards at the junction of Milfield Lane and Low Poppleton Lane were installed to restrict rat running movements between the outer ring road and Boroughbridge Road. This would occur if these restrictions were removed.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A454	Support Manor School access over Civil Service access on safety grounds	105	338	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment.	No Change
A455	Support access across former Manor school site, although needs to be located to one side of site.	123	549	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment.	No Change
A456	Access via former Manor School site would cause Boroughbridge Road to be unusable due to roundabouts and traffic lights.	128	562	Existing levels of traffic through links and junctions on the surrounding network will be assessed as part of a planning application and the impact of additional traffic will need to be satisfactorily mitigated. This may necessitate improvements to the highway network together with a range of transport measures to control the flow of traffic within the area. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	No Change
Civil Service					
A457	Support option for access via former Civil Service sports ground	93	290	Noted	No Change
		95	294		
		103	332		
		113	402		
		136	630		
A458	Support Civil Service access as it is safer	93	290	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment.	No Change
		113	402		
A459	Support Civil Service access as it would reduce congestion	93	290	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment.	No Change
A460	Support Civil Service access due to environmental benefits	93	290	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment.	No Change
		113	402		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A461	Support Civil Service access due to lack of development constraint	116	486	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment	No Change
A462	Support Civil Service access due to ability to deliver high capacity access	116	487	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment	No Change
A463	Support Civil Service access due to reduced impact on new manor School compared to more intensive use of Millfield Lane	116	488	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment	No Change
A464	Support Civil Service access due to it allowing a second point of access to the outer ring road	116	489	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment	No Change
A465	Support Civil Service access due to it allowing a high quality entrance to the development	116	492	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment	No Change
A466	Support Civil Service access in comparison to former Manor School access due to lack of impact on trees	116	490	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment	No Change
A467	Support use of Civil Service site as principal access, and Millfield Lane as secondary	116	485	Noted	No Change
A468	Support Civil Service access as it protects trees and open space on the Site, offers potential for new open space/ park and ride provision, and has reduced levels of traffic at the new Manor School site and at A59 between Beckfield Lane and Newlands Drive in comparison with the former Manor School access option.	118	504	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment	No Change
		159	710		
		160	712		
		161	713		
		162	714		
		163	715		
		164	718		
		165	719		
		166	720		
167	721				
168	722				

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
		169	723		
		170	724		
		171	725		
		172	726		
		173	727		
		174	728		
		175	729		
		176	730		
		177	731		
		178	732		
		179	734		
		180	735		
		181	736		
		182	737		
		183	738		
		184	739		
		185	740		
		186	741		
		187	742		
		188	743		
		189	744		
		190	745		
		191	746		
		192	747		
		193	748		
A469	Civil Service access seems to demonstrate greater consideration of local residents and the environment	178	733	The location of any new access to the development will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment. The access option taken forward will be the subject of further consultation and assessment within the planning process.	No Change
A470	Pedestrian/cycle bridge needed for Civil Service access option to increase safety for schoolchildren	93	291	Any new routes to the development site will be expected to connect safely with the existing pedestrian and cycle network surrounding the site, as set out in para 7.15.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A471	Object to Civil Service access due to residential disamenity	105	338	If the Civil Service site access its pursued it will be important to minimise the environmental affects on adjoining residential areas, through retaining existing trees where possible and enhancing the landscape.	No Change
A472	Object to Civil Service access due to potential for use as a rat run	105	339	If the Civil Service access is pursued a range of measures will be employed to divert through traffic away from the main residential areas.	No Change
A473	Object to Civil Service access due to impact on cyclists/ pedestrians, particularly schoolchildren	105	340	Any new routes to the development site will be expected to connect safely with the existing pedestrian and cycle network surrounding the site, as set out in para 7.15.	No Change
A474	Access via the former Civil Service Sports Ground would require compulsory purchase of third party land	135	615	Land assembly is an issue for the developer of the site.	No Change
A475	Civil Service route would affect residents, destroy important area of green belt, create problems on A59, require a safe crossing of Milfield Lane, near a bad bend in the road.	123	547	If the Civil Service site access its pursued it will be important to minimise the environmental affects on adjoining residential areas. The location of any new access will be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment.	No Change
A476	Query why access across former Civil Service Sports Ground is not within development site.	120	521	The access onto A59 has yet to be determined through masterplanning and Transport Assessment. The planning application will include any land necessary in order to facilitate the development.	No Change
A1237					
A477	Access to the outer ring road should be avoided	11	23	The overall approach to vehicular movement should be to provide a number of access points to the development site in order to spread the impact of additional traffic on the network and comprehensively mitigate the impact where possible.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A478	Query whether through traffic will be allowed from A1237 onto Boroughbridge Road	47	136	The aim will be to ensure there are measures to discourage traffic cutting through the site between the A1237 and the A59.	No Change
A479	Direct access to A1237 should be provided	98	301	The overall approach to vehicular movement should be to provide a number of access points to the development site in order to spread the impact of additional traffic on the network and comprehensively mitigate the impact where possible.	No Change
A480	It will be difficult to prevent rat running from Outer Ring Road to A59	101	315	The aim will be to ensure there are measures to discourage through traffic between the A1237 and the A59.	No Change
A481	Concern about congestion on A1237	109	370	Upgrading of the Outer Ring Road has been considered as part of the improvements necessitated through the York Northwest development as a whole, and it is likely that the British Sugar development will have to contribute to these works. The requirement to do this is set out in Statement 23 of the draft SPD. Para 7.37 could be amended to reflect the approach outlined in the YNW Transport Masterplan	Amend text within para 7.37 to reflect the content of the YNW Transport Masterplan and CIL.
		147	664		
		154	692		
Plantation Drive					
A482	Concern about level of use of Plantation Drive	22	64	The restricted access options for Plantation Drive and Ouse Acres set out in the draft SPD envisage limitations on their use through the design of the development. Thus, for example, vehicular access for private vehicles would only be possible to a limited number of dwellings.	Amend para 7.14 to clarify the term 'restricted'.
		80	247		
		30	104		
		113	403		
		120	522		
		118	507		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A483	Query necessity of making Plantation Drive restricted access.	27	74	There is limited capacity on Plantation Drive to accommodate unrestricted levels of additional traffic.	No Change
		103	328		
A484	It is unnecessary to use Plantation Drive; a constrained residential street	116	484	The overall approach to vehicular movement should be to provide a number of access points to the development site in order to spread the impact of additional traffic on the network and comprehensively mitigate the impact where possible.	No Change
A485	Use of Plantation Drive and Ouseacres should be minimised and restricted to previous operational levels in Plantation Drive	63	186	The number of additional homes served by these accesses will be determined through transport assessment.	Amend para 7.14 to clarify the term 'restricted'.
A486	Would resist additional traffic using Plantation Drive	84	260	Plantation Drive was historically used as a vehicular access when the British Sugar site was in operation. The capacity of the road to accommodate additional homes will be determined through transport assessment.	See revised para 7.14
A487	Unrestricted access at Plantation Drive could accommodate city-bound trips, easing congestion on the northern sections of Boroughbridge Rd	106	344	There is limited capacity on Plantation Drive to accommodate unrestricted levels of additional traffic.	No Change
A488	The number of dwellings potentially served off Ouse Acres or Plantation Drive should not be specified in the brief as this will be informed by the ongoing detailed assessment work.	115	457	The text could be amended to refer to the capacity of the road to accommodate traffic levels whilst having regard to the historic levels of use.	See revised para 7.14

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A489	Oppose use of Plantation Drive for public transport or commercial vehicles. The junction at Boroughbridge Road is extremely difficult to exit.	197	759	The overall approach to public transport movement should be to provide a route through the site in order to ensure permeability and access to services. The junction arrangements at Boroughbridge Road will be considered as part of the Transport Assessment with highway improvement works carried out where appropriate.	No Change
A490	Support restricted access to a limited number of dwellings via Plantation Drive	200	775	Restricted access via Plantation Drive is supported in the draft SPD subject to the amendments suggested at 7.14 to clarify the term 'restricted'.	See revised para 7.14
Ouse Acres					
A491	Concern about level of use of Ouse Acres	40	120	Para 7.14 outlines that should Ouse Acres be used as an access the level of traffic would be restricted.	No Change
		95	296		
A492	Concern that traffic levels on Ouseacres have already increased	96	297	Para 7.14 outlines that should Ouse Acres be used as an access the level of traffic would be restricted.	No Change
A494	Query necessity of making Ouse Acres restricted access.	27	75	There is limited capacity on Ouse Acres to accomodate unrestricted levels of additional traffic.	No Change
		103	329		
A495	It is unnecessary to use Ouse Acres; a constrained residential street	116	484	The overall approach to vehicular movement should be to provide a number of access points to the development site in order to spread the impact of additional traffic on the network and comprehensively mitigate the impact where possible.	No Change
A496	Support use of Ouse Acres for vehicular traffic	113	404	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A497	Use of Ouseacres will lead to parking problems and high risk of accidents/conflict with children playing	46	131	Should Ouse Acres be pursued as an access safety and parking issues would need to be considered as part of design proposals. The text at para 7.14 could be amended to refer to the need to address issues of safety, parking and environmental attractiveness.	Amend para 7.14
A498	Unrestricted access at Ouse Acres could accommodate city-bound trips, easing congestion on the northern sections of Boroughbridge Rd	106	344	There is limited capacity on Ouse Acres to accommodate unrestricted levels of additional traffic.	No Change
A499	Query nature and manner of Ouse Acres restriction	109	374	There is limited capacity on Ouse Acres to accommodate unrestricted levels of additional traffic. The number of additional homes served by these accesses will be determined through transport assessment.	No Change
Gt North Way					
A500	Support for new access via Great North Way	17 27 49 59 68 49 56 103 108 136 123 157	43 72 144 170 216 144 162 331 359 629 546 709	Transport modelling on the impact of development on the surrounding road network with the provision of a new route via York Business Park has been undertaken. This demonstrated that there would be limited benefit whilst the significant costs of this would be unlikely to be deliverable through the development.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A501	Access via Great North Way would have economic and environmental benefits	103	327	The benefits of linking the area with the adjoining business park are recognised. The new potential pedestrian/cycle route over the railway would ensure employment opportunities in this area are accessible and would also provide a more sustainable route. Text at para 7.16 could be amended to outline the intention to provide an east-west bridge together with a link to Water End, outline the need for contributions towards the provision of this subject to further deliverability issues, dedicate land within the site and ensure that future provision of a link is not prejudiced by the design of the development. Off site provision of open space and any supporting infrastructure requirements will be dependent on scheme design and viability appraisal.	Amend para 7.16
A502	Suggest that if the Great North Way access is most appropriate, the Council require that the developers use this.	194	749	Transport modelling on the impact of development on the surrounding road network with the provision of a new route via York Business Park has been undertaken. This demonstrated that there would be limited benefit whilst the significant cost of this would be unlikely to be deliverable through the development.	No Change
Statement 19: New sustainable transport routes					
A503	Should provide access to River Ouse and a riverboat service between park and ride and city centre	10	19	A river boat service would be a commercial operation and is unlikely to be deliverable through the development.	No Change
A504	Concern at loss of parking due to additional routes provided via Sovereign Park	208	816	There is no intention to provide additional routes via Sovereign Park	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
Rail					
A505	Support tram train/ is important	28	88	Noted	No Change
		38	119		
		38	123		
		63	189		
		75	230		
		121	531		
		126	561		
A506	Tram train should link to Poppleton park and ride	28	90	There is already a station at Poppleton. Any tram train proposal would use the existing track lines.	No Change
		75	230		
A507	To locate a park and rail site at the development site	76	234	This would draw significant traffic flows into this suburban residential area and could undermine the location of the park and ride facility at the A59 Poppleton site.	No Change
		17	45		
		211	831		
A508	Improvement to the Harrogate rail service and parking availability at Poppleton should be made	35	114	There are options currently being explored to provide a strategic improvement to services on the Harrogate line. Additional parking facilities at Poppleton could not be sought from the developer of this site and would be a commercial decision by the operator of the rail service.	No Change
A509	A railway station would be a waste of money	8	12	The provision of a rail halt would enhance the availability of public transport to the future occupiers of the site. The funding package for any facility and the additional infrastructure improvements required would need to be established and justified.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A510	Support provision of additional rail station/ halt on Harrogate line	55	157	Tram-train is a long term project and the SPD supports the provision of this together with ancillary facilities. Suggest text at para 7.18 is strengthened to ensure future provision of land to enable provision of this facility, should it be pursued.	Amend para 7.18
		85	263		
		56	163		
		70	219		
		109	381		
		128	565		
		150	674		
		199	773		
		207	805		
A511	Reinstate a stop and service on Harrogate line for the site and create one at Poppleton Park as planned.	123	544	Para 7.18 outlines the need of the development to support the provision of a rail halt should this be taken forward as project. Suggest text at para 7.18 is strengthened to ensure future provision of land to enable provision of this facility, should it be pursued.	Amend para 7.18
A512	Provide a rail station with car parking within York Business Park	59	169	Options to provide a rail station on land within York Business Park have previously been explored and land was reserved in an agreement. Implementation of a facility on this land is however time constrained. The implementation of any new facility would need to be progressed as part of a strategic programme of improvement and also need additional improvements to rail infrastructure on this line and a funding package to support it. Suggest text at para 7.18 is strengthened to ensure future provision of land to enable provision of this facility, should it be pursued.	Amend para 7.18
A513	Support commuter station	77	236	A proposal for a commuter station would be a commercial decision by a rail operator.	No Change
A514	Support provision of a shuttle train between city centre and the site	76	233	Provision of a localised service on this line is constrained in terms of service provision, infrastructure and funding.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A515	Support re-opening of Nether Poppleton station	148	668	The funding package for any facility and the additional infrastructure improvements required would need to be established and justified.	No Change
A516	Support inclusion of land reserved for Nether Poppleton Rail halt into development area	157	705	Para 7.18 does refer to the need to accomodated appropriately located land for a potential rail halt. The location of this halt will be reviewed as part of the masterplanning stage of work. The land at York Business Park identified previously for a halt is time constrained in terms of its implementation.	No Change
A517	Additional statement to Principle 8 suggested, 'to ensure that development of this site is delivered in a way which does not prejudice the development of light rapid public transport (tram-train) system serving the railway station, York Central and the Outer Ring Road'.	75	230	The need to ensure that the development of this area does not prejudice the implementation of tram train is covered in para 7.18 of the draft SPD	No Change
A518	Reference to potential financial contribution to tram-train is unnecessary since tram train is not proposed as part of the programme and should be deleted.	115	458	Given the likely term over which the development will be phased, and the existing and forecast constraints associated with the local highway network, facilitation of tram-train as part of a wider package of contributions will be necessary in order to make the proposed development acceptable in planning terms. Financial contributions could be both directly related to the development and fairly and reasonably related in kind and scale to the proposed development. Given the longer term nature of tram-train, the appropriate mechanism to reimburse monies to a developer that are not spent after a given time period would be built into any agreement. The approach set out in the SPD is necessary and sound, and no changes are recommended.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A519	Land could be reserved for tram train but no reliance should be given to this.	135	617	It is recognised that in order for tram train to be progressed there would need to be a funding package for a strategic project with the additional infrastructure improvements required programmed and implemented at an appropriate stage.	No Change
A520	Eco friendly electric trains which are low cost and frequent should link park and ride and this site to the city	211	829	A feasibility study is currently being progressed to consider the option of heavy-rail electric trains as part of a wider strategic project on this line.	No Change
A521	Rail access should be provided to enable access to the city and wider region. References to this are not sufficiently bold in their vision. Further work required to investigate requirements for this	217	864	Enhanced rail services via the Harrogate line are currently being investigated. The vision for developing services on this line is being progressed therefore but its implementation will depend on feasibility work, infrastructure improvements and the need for a funded programme of works.	No Change
Pedestrian/Cycle					
A522	Concern about pedestrian/ cycle link to water End	41	125	Off site pedestrian and cycle provision will be considered in more detail as part of subsequent planning application processes.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A523	Need to look at area comprehensively and provide rail/pedestrian and cycle links	59	171	Noted	No Change
A524	Pedestrian and cycle links should be made between the site and the Ings/River Ouse	2	3	Off site pedestrian and cycle provision will be considered in more detail as part of subsequent planning application processes. Text at para 7.16 could be amended to outline the intention to provide an east-west bridge together with a link to Water End,	Amend para 7.16
		38	122	outline the need for contributions towards the provision	
		38	118	of this subject to further deliverability issues, dedicate	
		210	826	land within the site and ensure that future provision of a link is not prejudiced by the design of the development. Off site provision of open space and any supporting infrastructure requirements will be dependent on scheme design and viability appraisal.	
		65	208		
A525	The bridge to Clifton Ings is in the wrong place	5	6	The precise nature and location of off-site pedestrian and cycle links has not yet been determined, and will be considered in more detail as part of subsequent planning processes.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A526	Need to consider linkage to Acomb/Poppleton and Rawcliffe Ings	65	208	Off site pedestrian and cycle provision will be considered in more detail as part of subsequent planning processes. Text at para 7.16 could be amended to outline the intention to provide an east-west bridge together with a link to Water End, outline the need for contributions towards the provision of this subject to further deliverability issues, dedicate land within the site and ensure that future provision of a link is not prejudiced by the design of the development. Off site provision of open space and any supporting infrastructure requirements will be dependent on scheme design and viability appraisal.	Amend para 7.16.
A527	Linkages need to be made between the proposed Park and Ride and the cycle path over the outer ring road	65	209	Off site pedestrian and cycle provision will be considered in more detail as part of subsequent planning processes.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
A528	Support good pedestrian/ cycle access with direct routes into York.	67 81 210	214 252 826	Noted	No Change
A529	Off -road cycle routes needed	151	676	Noted	No Change
A530	Separate pedestrian and cycle routes should be provided which are safe & give priority to these modes	67	214	Suggest Statement 20 refers to the promotion of sustainable modes through design. Further for text at para 6.22 and 6.23 are amended to refer to the primacy of pedestrians and cyclists in the movement strategy and the design of the development. As a residential area low traffic speeds will be encouraged and suggest text is amended at para 7.22 to reflect this. To promote sustainable modes of transport suggest reference is made to travel planning in para 7.22.	Amend Statement 20 and paras 6.22, 6.23 and 7.22.
A531	Provision of a pedestrian/cycle link to water End is problematic, with land acquisition costs and funding unclear.	135	616	Off site pedestrian and cycle provision will be considered in more detail as part of subsequent planning processes.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A532	New well maintained cycle routes required	145	657	Noted	No Change
A533	Support a proposed cycle track alongside railway line	128	567	Noted	No Change
A534	Should consider alternative route for cycle path using existing tunnel under the railway and over Yorkshire Water land.	128	568	Off site pedestrian and cycle provision will be considered in more detail as part of subsequent planning processes.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
A535	Should consider opportunity to provide cycle/pedestrian access across railway and river to link with Sustrans route in Rawcliffe Ings.	130	574	Provision of a routeover both the railines and river is likely to be prohibitively expensive.	No Change
A536	Weather should be taken into consideration in the design of pedestrian and cycle routes	117	498	Whilst the British climate may affect the overall proportion of local trips made by cycling and walking, there is little that can be done to mitigate its impact on routes to and from the city centre. Within the development site, walking and cycling routes will likely be incorporated within areas of open space, offering opportunities for tree planting to afford protection from the elements. This can be pursued through the detailed planning of the area.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
Bus					
A537	Frequent bus service should be provided into the city centre	55	158	The provision of frequent bus services to the city centre will be a central element of the package of transport measures as required in Statement 20 of the draft SPD and in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
A538	Question ability of bus network to provide sustainable travel	63	187	Improvements to the reliability, frequency and capacity of bus services is very likely to be required as part of the package of transport measures as required in Statement 20 of the draft SPD and in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	Discussions with bus operators will need to be undertaken at an early stage to support any transport proposals and ensure deliverability.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A539	Bus service needs to be improved	48	138	Noted	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
A540	Additional buses will be required - number 10 is at capacity already	145	655	The provision of additional buses through the development is likely to form an element of the transport package as set out in Statement 20 of the draft SPD and in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
A541	Cheaper and more reliable public transport is needed	108	358	Noted	No Change
A542	Support Park and Ride	150	672	Noted	No Change
A543	Support provision of Park and Ride at former Civil Service site over the currently selected site due to reduced costs, reduced impact at the A59/A1237 roundabout, reduced traffic on Millfield Lane, increased patronage through location on "desire line" to city centre, and providing a direct link between British Sugar and the Park and Ride.	116	493	A site selection process has already been undertaken to establish the preferred site for the park and ride facility at the A59 and has been the subject of public consultation. Funding bids are being pursued on the basis of detailed scheme proposals.No alternative site is being considered by the council at the current time.	No Change
A544	The rare opportunity to implement pedestrian and cycle routes in advance of/ at same time as development should be taken	153	686	The phasing of pedestrian and cycle routes will relate to the build-out of the development they will serve. It is unlikely that routes will be provided in advance of development given the likely 10-15 year build out of the development and the need to maintain site security and development cashflows.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A545	Concern over impact on bus travel by increased congestion	137	634	Bus priority measures are proposed on the A59 as part of the Access York funding programme and may be required within the British Sugar site as part of its development. These will reduce the detrimental impact or congestion on bus journey times.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
A546	Bus service should be provided via Ouseacres and Millfield Lane.	128	569	The routing of bus services through the development site will be considered in more detail as part of the planning application process. Para 7.17 establishes the principle of a direct and accessible bus route through the site.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process.
A547	The Park and Ride could stop on Boroughbridge Road at the two limited access points rather than add more buses.	123	545	Park and Ride buses need to offer rapid and ideally direct services to the city centre in order to be an attractive alternative to the car. It is envisaged that local bus services as opposed to Park and Ride services will serve the development site.	No Change
Principle 9: To ensure as many trips as possible are taken by sustainable travel modes and to promote and facilitate modal shift from the car to sustainable forms of travel by maximising opportunities for walking, cycling and public transport use.					
A548	Needs further explanation	21	58	More detail on the precise nature of improvements will emerge through subsequent more detailed stages of the planning process	No Change
A549	Query deliverability	21	58	More detail on the precise nature of improvements will emerge through subsequent more detailed stages of the planning process	No Change
		106	343		
A550	Some people cannot use buses	134	589	Mobility impaired people feature highly in the Councils adopted 'hierarchy of users', and adequate provision will be made for such persons through the detailed planning of the development.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
Statement 20: Optimise availability and attractiveness of walking, cycling and PT					
A551	Public transport improvements will be	8	11	As well as new residents of the development	To note comments in further stages of the

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
	required - existing services are limited	48	138	increasing patronage of buses and potentially increasing frequencies, developer contributions may be sought as part of a transport package, to increase service frequencies in the short term, and potentially to provide and service new routes. this is set out in Statement 20 of the draft SPD and in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	planning process
A552	Frequent bus service should be provided into the city centre	55	158	The importance of this is acknowledged by the Council. As well as new residents of the development increasing patronage of buses and potentially increasing frequencies, developer contributions may be sought as part of a transport package, to increase service frequencies in the short term. This is set out in Statement 20 of the draft SPD and in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A553	Question ability of bus network to provide sustainable travel	63	187	The local bus network in this area is a frequent and reliable alternative to the car for trips to many destinations, though principally those to or through the City Centre. Improvements to bus services will be sought as appropriate, as part of a package of other sustainable transport improvements.	No Change
A554	Frequent bus service connecting to York Central is needed	17	44	The timing of the York Central development will most likely preclude these links being provided in the short term, however in the longer term, the importance of city-bound buses routing through York Central is acknowledged by the Council.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process and in the development of the York Central site.
A555	Frequent bus service to Acomb and Clifton Moor required	17	46	The importance of bus links between the site and both Acomb and Clifton Moor is acknowledged by the Council, and these are likely to form an important part of the transport package secured through the redevelopment.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A556	Excellent public transport is needed to prevent the development being a dormitory residential area	17	49	The importance of public transport is acknowledged in Statement 20 the draft SPD and the YNW transport Masterplan. Good links to the City Centre will be a key element of any transport package secured through the redevelopment of the site.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A557	Essential that Transport Masterplan is finalised to inform the developers masterplanning	135	612	Work on the transport masterplan is progressing, and weight is now given to this document in the draft Core Strategy.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A558	Public transport has decreased in frequency and standard of provision in recent years and therefore question whether good transport links can be achieved	206	799	Frequent reliable public transport will be an important component of a sustainable transport package to serve the site. New residents of the development should increase patronage of services and make them more financially viable, potentially resulting in frequency improvements. Developer contributions will also be sought to increase the frequency of services in the short term, making them a more attractive travel options. If it is not considered viable to provide an appropriate frequency of service, alternative travel options will be explored through the developments transport package.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A559	Agree with the need to access site by sustainable forms of transport including a more regular bus service along Boroughbridge Road	216	858	The frequency and routing of bus services is a key issue, and any necessary improvements will form a component part of the sites transport package, as required in Statement 20 of the draft SPD and in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A560	Good quality cycle paths will encourage cycling and clear cycle priority at junctions with 'traffic lights'	218	873	The importance of dedicated cycle paths is recognised in Statement 20 of the draft SPD and in the YNW Transport Masterplan. Any necessary improvements or new provision will form a component part of the sites transport package. The treatment of cyclist priorities at highway junctions will form part of these considerations and will also be secured where necessary.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
Statement 21: Minimise car parking					
A561	Needs further explanation and is not really practical	21	58	More detail on this issue will emerge through subsequent, more detailed stages of the planning process. Reducing car parking levels from traditional levels is entirely feasible in this suburban location, given a range of alternative travel modes, and will be pursued	No Change
A562	Do not support restrictions on car usage	11	21	Promoting more sustainable transport is a key element of the governments national planning policy, and essential to reduce our environmental impact. Given the location of the development site, restrictions on the availability of car parking, and promotion of alternative travel modes is a feasible option and should be pursued.	No Change
		27	80		
		29	91		
A563	Car parking should be maximised	27	81	This would lead to increased numbers of car trips being generated from the site, which would be contrary to national planning policy and detrimental to the local and global environment. This approach will not be pursued	No Change
A564	Some trips will still need to be made by car: parking provision levels should reflect this	16	39	This is acknowledged - any approach to reduced parking levels will need to be pragmatic and mindful of the effects of illegal and overspill car parking	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
		33	107		
A565	Adequate parking and road widths should be provided	147	663	This will be secured as part of the detailed planning process.	No Change
A566	Traffic calming should be considered as an alternative to parking restrictions	16	39	Traffic calming within the site and potentially in the surrounding area will be an important component of the transport package that will be negotiated from the development in subsequent stages of planning. It will be considered in addition to parking restrictions	

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A567	Support for car free development	55	156	Noted	No Change
A568	Restricting car parking is unrealistic	63	188	It is not unrealistic to restrict car parking although any approach will need to be pragmatic and mindful of the effects of overspill and illegal car parking	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A569	Cannot assume lower car ownership levels	199	771	Car ownership levels can be influenced by the nature of the development and the availability of alternatives such as public transport, cycling provision and car clubs. Any assumptions on car ownership and associated parking will be made as part of the detailed planning application process and will need to be pragmatic and mindful of the effects of overspill and illegal parking.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A570	Should anticipate that future occupiers will have at least 2 cars and commercial works vans vehicles will access area	86	268	The level of car ownership within the development will be determined to a degree by the approach to car parking provision and sustainable transport options themselves, and will also depend on the type and size of properties. It is likely that a range of approaches to car parking provision will be used in discrete areas of the development site to facilitate both residential and commercial development. The approaches adopted will be pragmatic and mindful of the effects of overspill and illegal parking.	To note comments in further stages of the planning of the site
A571	Some car parking will still be required	107 154	351 695	Noted. The precise level of car parking will emerge through the detailed planning application process, and residential and commercial parking will be required as part of the development	To note comments in further stages of the planning process

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A572	Concern at the reduction of car parking spaces as this should be considered as part of masterplanning discussions.	115	459	Principle 9 outlines the approach of ensuring as many trips as possible are undertaken using sustainable travel modes. To deliver this, a complementary strategy of maximising sustainable travel whilst seeking to minimise car use is taken. Carefully tailoring the car parking provision to minimum levels is one of the package of measures outlined to achieve this.	No Change
A573	Concern over reduced parking. A balanced approach is needed and should recognise future more sustainable technologies to power vehicles, eg, electric cars	212	839	Statement 22 of the draft SPD refers to the promotion of more environmentally friendly vehicles. The approach to reduced levels of parking are outlined in para 7.27 and 7.28 of the draft SPD.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A574	Car parking should not be reduced too far as even if sustainable trips are taken people use cars for other trips and lack of provision may lead to parking on grass verges/footpaths	218	872	This is acknowledged, whilst measures such as car clubs can be used to cater for less frequent car based trips, an appropriate level of parking should be provided within the development to prevent overspill and illegal parking	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A575	Priority for access by walking, cycling and bus rather than car if car free development proposed	223	888	Car-free development is not proposed in the draft SPD and would need careful consideration, and an appropriate range of alternative modes of transport, as outlined in Principle 9.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A576	Lack of parking provision and narrow roads in Sovereign Park has led to parking problems. Even if sustainable transport is provided people will continue to use cars and this must be catered for to make the development work well	216	859	This is acknowledged, though the scale of the British Sugar site should give any reduced parking strategy a greater chance of success. A degree of pragmatism will be needed in the application of parking standards however, and as set out in Statement 21 of the draft SPD, alternative options such as public transport, cycle routes and car clubs will be required to support reduced parking provision.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
Principle 10: To minimise the environmental impact of vehicle trips to and from the development and mitigate the impact of residual car trips on the highway network where possible.					
A577	Needs more explanation	21	58	The principle needs to be overarching to cover the issues raised in the following Statements. This principle is directed to reducing the environmental affect of vehicles, eg through lower emission vehicles and providing highway improvements which will enable the highway network to operate more efficiently.	No Change
A578	Query deliverability	21	58	The draft SPD sets out an approach to accessing the site and managing travel demands generated by the development. This approach seeks to maximise opportunities for travel by sustainable means in the first instance to reduce impact on the surrounding area and city. The Transport Assessment will need to demonstrate the delivery of this.	No Change
		106	343		
A579	Concern over traffic issues and impact of these on older people.	131	578	Additional traffic will be planned for, and its impacts on all sectors of society will be required to be mitigated satisfactorily by the developer, as set out at Stament 23 of the draft SPD.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A580	Concern about congestion leading to pollution and resultant health risks.	207 134	810 588	The levels of congestion in the local area, and resultant impacts on air quality are noted by the local authority. Although pollutant levels are not severe enough to warrant designation of a local air quality management area, the draft SPD seeks to reduce the developments impacts in this respect through promoting sustainable travel and the efficient operation of the highway network	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
Statement 22: Promote environmentally friendly vehicles					
A581	Electric cars reduce the promissive effect	5	5	Noted	No Change.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A582	Use of electric cars currently limited, query whether intention is for recharging points to be provided	48	137	It is anticipated that use of electric cars will increase and it is therefore important to ensure the design of the development provides the enabling infrastructure for this. Electric recharge points will be sought with the specific detail of type, number and location of points to be determined.	No Change.
A583	Unrealistic reliance on people purchasing homes having electric vehicles. Clarification needed whether this will mean individual properties needing recharging facilities for electric cars	214	851	In line with the councils emerging Low Emission Strategy (due for publication in 2011) the development should include opportunities for low emissions infrastructure. Specific detail on the type, number and location of points to be determined.	No Change.
A584	Use of electric cars is not a current alternative	63	190	Noted	No Change.
A585	Support provision of charging stations	102	322	Noted	No Change.
A586	Statement should be deleted. Text at 7.33 should be amended to refer to enabling infrastructure could include rather than should.	115	460	The statement refers to promotion of more environmentally friendly vehicles. PPS13, states that clean road transport fuels and technologies are now available that can offer air quality and climate change benefits compared to conventional petrol and diesel and a key factor in encouraging the wider take-up of these fuels and technologies is the development of the associated recharging or refuelling infrastructure. The types of measures set out in the statement may be necessary to make the proposed development acceptable in planning terms. The measures may be provided in a manner that is directly related to the development, and fairly and reasonably related in scale and kind to the proposed development. The statement should therefore remain in the SPD	No Change.

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A587	Text at 7.33 should be amended to refer to enabling infrastructure "could include" rather than "should include".	115	461	It is not considered unduly onerous to set out a presumption that these types of infrastructure and interventions should be provided given the scale of the development and the opportunities and constraints associated with the site and the long term nature of the development.	No Change.
A588	Reference to off-site contributions to provide lower emission service vehicles should be deleted	115	462	Offsetting increases in carbon emissions that result from the development may be necessary to make the proposed development acceptable in planning terms. This off-setting would need to be directly related to the proposed development and fairly and reasonably related in scale and kind to the development. It is considered feasible for contributions to comply with these criteria, and therefore the reference should remain in the SPD	No Change.
A589	Low emission vehicles do not necessarily reduce the cities carbon footprint and could lead to more road congestion and not encourage modal shift away from the car.	135	618	Noted	No Change.
Statement 23: Mitigate impacts through network improvements					
A590	Traffic lights cause rat-runs	27	85	Traffic lights are an important tool in managing traffic flows and are likely to constitute a part of the improvements to the local network delivered by the development, though their deployment will be carefully considered in terms of impacts on the wider network.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A591	Northern Ring Road needs to be upgraded to dual carriageway	29	92	Works to the Outer Ring road are outlined in the Transport Masterplan as part of the improvements necessitated through the York Northwest development as a whole, and it is likely that the British Sugar development will have to contribute to these works, alongside other developments and public funding. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
		98	301		
		100	309		
		71	222		
		109	371		
A592	Outer Ring Road will need upgrading	154	692	Upgrading of the Outer Ring road has been considered as part of the improvements necessitated through the York Northwest development as a whole, and it is likely that the British Sugar development will have to contribute to these works, alongside other developments and public funding. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A593	Upgrades to road/ transport infrastructure are essential	100	311	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
		46	130		

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A594	Developer should contribute to costs of making A1237 a dual carriageway	71	222	Partial dualling of the Outer Ring Road has been considered as part of the improvements necessitated through the York Northwest development as a whole, and it is likely that the British Sugar development will have to contribute to these works, alongside other developments and public funding. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these will be further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A595	A59/ A1237 roundabout will become a traffic black spot	104	337	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these will be further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A596	Design of connecting roads needs to ensure commercial vehicles can access the site.	47	135	All new highways will be constructed to a standard that allows residential and commercial vehicular access, this will be ensured through conditions on any planning approval.	No Change
A597	Concern about congestion in general	55 56 71 79 93 112	159 161 221 241 288 391	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable	To note comments in further stages of the planning process

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
		156	703	travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	
A598	Concern about traffic impact at Poppleton	112	391	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A599	Concern about rat running in Poppleton	112	394	Rat running through Poppleton is a key transport impact that must be prevented or mitigated through the development as part of the planning application process. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	Comments to be addressed in the Transport Assessment. To note comments in further stages of the planning process
		144	651		
		145	656		
		137	635		
A600	Concern about impact at York	112	393	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local	To note comments in further stages of the

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
	Business Park	144	649	and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation, as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	planning process
A601	Congestion at Poppleton Park junction will be exacerbated and a roundabout should therefore be considered	66	211	Improvements to the local highway network will be an essential component of mitigating the impact of the development. Junction improvements at Poppleton Park will be considered as part of this mitigation package. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these will be further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A602	Increased volume of traffic at Nether Poppleton roundabout will overwhelm capacity.	136	623	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of planning the development

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A603	Access to Nether Poppleton will be severely impeded by congestion around Nether Poppleton roundabout.	136	627	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A604	Visitors to business in Milfield Lane park on the highway and request no limitations or restrictions to on street	78	239	On street parking limitations on Millfield Lane have not been considered by the Council to date.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A605	Queuing traffic (to York Business Park roundabout) will extend over level crossing leading to safety concerns.	136	624	The impact of additional traffic on Millfield Lane level crossing will be an important consideration. Initial discussions with Network Rail have revealed that this impact can be satisfactorily mitigated - this will be required as part of any detailed planning application	To continue to note this issue in further stages of the planning process
A606	Adequate space for new road layouts and safety security issues required.	79	241	Adequate provision will be ensured through the detailed design of any scheme considered as part of a planning application	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A607	Concern about congestion impact on the safe and efficient operation of the strategic road network	89	276	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. Maintaining the safety and efficiency of the network will be a central part of this mitigation. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A608	Options to influence longer journeys and address congestion on the A64 need to be considered. Any improvements identified need to be deliverable.	89	277	The requirement for developers to influence modal distribution, and reduce reliance on the car for longer journeys is set out at Principle 9 of the draft SPD. Any direct impact on the A64 from the development will be assessed by the Highways Agency as part of any planning application.	No Change
A609	Reference to indicative apportionment of infrastructure costs is premature and should be deleted.	115	463	The apportionment of infrastructure is referred to as indicative and the level of phasing will be subject to negotiation.	No Change
A610	A separate access for commercial vehicles should be provided. Remove access restrictions in Low Poppleton Lane	49	141	The level of commercial development envisaged on the site is not of a scale significant enough to warrant an independent access.	No Change
A611	More detail needed on the nature and manner of traffic control	144	652	This will emerge through the planning application process as more detailed modelling work is undertaken.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A612	A rat run will be created between A59 and the ring road.	136	625	It is envisaged at para 7.13 of the draft SPD that the two site accesses would serve discrete zones of the development site, with through access limited to public transport. This would prevent the forming of a rat run.	No Change
A613	Traffic congestion issues cannot be eliminated with traffic measures to A59 due to the trips generated outside the city boundary: liaison with local authorities outside the city is therefore needed.	133	584	Adjoining local authorities will be consulted as part of the planning application process.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A614	Concern about management of construction traffic	156	704	The patterns of operation of construction traffic will be managed through a condition applied to grant of planning permission in order to minimise environmental and amenity impacts.	No Change
A615	4 way traffic filters should be provided at junction with Ouseacres.	128	571	Appropriate junction improvements will be considered as part of the Transport Assessment accompanying a planning application as referred to in Statement 23.	No Change
A616	Any highway improvements/mitigation measures will be limited by existing development/housing in Boroughbridge Road	206	795	Highway improvements and mitigation will need to be made without the demolition of existing residential development. If adequate mitigation or improvement cannot be made, either the quantum of development, or the number of trips generated by it will need to be reduced. At this stage it is considered feasible to make satisfactory improvements to the A59 corridor within the existing highway envelope.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A617	Upgraded roads are needed to ease existing traffic problems	207	804	Whilst the development cannot remedy pre-existing problems, mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A618	Significant additional traffic potentially generating 2000 cars without any upgrade of local roads and on roads which are already congested	207	802	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
A619	Inadequate improvements to the road network to accommodate for new additional traffic related to housing development	211	828	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of planning the development

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A620	Development will increase traffic and congestion on local roads and the ring road	212	843	Mitigating the impact of additional traffic on the local and strategic transport network will be a key part of any successful planning application on the site. The development will be expected to meet the costs of this mitigation , as well as reducing the level of traffic generation on the site through facilitating sustainable travel and the siting and design of development. Statement 23 of the draft SPD sets out the approach for mitigation measures and these are further addressed in the YNW Transport Masterplan.	To note comments in further stages of the planning process
Delivery and Implementation					
A621	Site needs to be timed to co-ordinate with York Central	17	49	The development site was formerly being planned for as part of the York Northwest area, including York Central. It is now anticipated that the British Sugar site will be developed in advance of York Central, and a separate planning framework is being pursued for each site.	No Change
A622	The biodiversity management plan should be included within the Environmental Statement.	115	464	The Environmental Statement will refer to the biodiversity interest on the site whereas a Biodiversity Management Plan outlines the approach to managing the area. It is therefore necessary to have a separate Plan to cover these issues.	No Change
A623	Design Code issues will be addressed in the Design and Access Statement	115	465	This document is intended to outline a consistent design approach to all areas within the site.	No Change
A624	It is more appropriate for the Training Skills and Development Statement to be considered at reserved matters stage and a broad condition to deal with this at outline.	115	466	These issues will be relevant to the whole area and it will therefore be appropriate for broad consideration to be given at the outline stage.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A625	Retail impact assessment should be referred to as PPS4 Assessment	115	467	It is considered that the reference to a Retail Impact Assessment to be provided by the applicants is justifiable and correct. Throughout the SPD and also the accompanying retail note clear reference is made to the requirements of PPS4 and what needs to be included within the RIA.	No Change
A626	It is not a planning requirement to build a specific number of dwellings per year so reference to completion rates should be deleted.	115	468	Phasing will be an important consideration in any planning application. The text is caveated as being dependent on market conditions and is included to indicate estimated delivery on the site.	No Change
A627	Delivery rates of 150 dpa ambitious given current economic climate, planning requirements (thought to delay commencement of development to 2014/15), demand for housing and physical capacity for housebuilders to deliver housing. Delivery rates of 35 dpa 2014/15 and 50 dpa thereafter are proposed as more appropriate	119	520	The estimated rates of construction are based on work undertaken for the SHLAA which explored the rate at which other development sites in the city had been built out. The levels given in the draft SPD are included for illustrative purposes only, and are not planning requirements. Phasing of development will be agreed as part of the planning application processes.	No Change
A628	Don't want provision of "modern art"	29	99	Noted. The detailed nature of any public art installation will be informed by some form of public consultation as part of the planning application of subsequent stages of the scheme	No Change
A629	Developer provision should be subject to appropriate need and viability assessment	115	469	The text acknowledges that developer contributions will be subject to open book appraisal	No Change
A630	Welcome recognition that contributions will only be sought as appropriate	115	470	Noted	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A631	Clarification needed on terms, community management organisations and community project management team	115	471	Para 5.30 could be amended to clarify the provision of facilities to ensure future accessibility by the community. Para 8.19 refers to the role of the community project management team. The text can be amended to make this explicit. The community management organisations relate to the management of the community facilities. This will be made explicit in Figure 20.	Amend para 5.30 and Figure 20 to clarify.
A632	Should allow for future reviews of contributions to reflect prevailing marketing conditions rather than through reference to overage.	115	472	Text could be revised to include reference to prevailing market conditions.	Amend para 8.15 to include reference to market conditions.
A633	A green infrastructure strategy together with a biodiversity management plan will ensure development enhances the natural environment	64	203	The benefit of these approaches is acknowledged by the Council and developer and will be required to produce both a green infrastructure strategy and a biodiversity management plan as part of the planning application process as outlined in Figure 19 of the draft SPD.	No Change
A634	Developer bonds are a more effective mechanism to secure benefits	65	206	Developer contributions will be expected from the development according to the needs generated by the development and the arising impact. A S106 will be required as part of any outline planning application. The mechanisms to secure payments in this agreement will be considered as part of future negotiations and bonds may be considered if appropriate.	No Change
A635	Clarification on how long to complete the development needed	80	246	This will depend on the length of the pre-construction stages of the scheme and annual build-out rates, as well as the desire of the land-owners to release the site for development. An indication of the schemes delivery period is given in the draft SPD at para 8.5.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A636	Potential to use covenants to keep the development clean, tidy and maintained	107	355	Highways and public open space is typically adopted and maintained by the Council, and funded through developer contributions for maintenance and mainstream Council budgets. Alternative commercial or community led maintenance vehicles, which may involve covenants, would be considered by the Council as part of the planning application process should they be proposed.	No Change
A637	Delivery rate of 150 dpa is optimistic - 100 dpa would be more realistic	113	405	The estimated rates of construction are based on work undertaken for the SHLAA which explored the rate at which other development sites in the city had been built out. The levels given in the draft SPD are included for illustrative purposes only, and are not planning requirements. Phasing of development will be agreed as part of the planning application processes.	No Change
A638	Need to evidence financial viability and deliverability of planning obligations	113	406	The types of planning obligations outlined will be negotiated across phases of the development through open-book viability appraisal. Specific levels of contribution are not referenced in the document to maintain flexibility, and as a result detailed evidence of viability is not required for the draft SPD.	No Change

Cons Ref	Comment	Person ID	Comment ID	Officer Response	Officer Recommendations
A639	Rate of construction is too slow given the cities need for affordable housing	135	621	The estimated rates of construction are based on work undertaken for the SHLAA which explored the rate at which other development sites in the city had been built out. The levels given in the SPD are included for illustrative purposes only, and are not planning requirements. Phasing of development will be agreed as part of the planning application processes, and more rapid development that allows earlier delivery of affordable housing will be promoted within the context of the city -wide core strategy annual housing targets, and the physical capacity to build housing on the site.	No Change
A640	The Environmental Statement should include remediation proposals.	135	619	Noted	No Change
A641	The Green Infrastructure Strategy should include proposals for comprehensive advance landscaping.	135	620	The phasing of green infrastructure provision will be an important consideration in determining any planning application as outlined in para 8.9 of the draft SPD and establishing strategic landscaping in accordance with an agreed masterplan in advance of development will allow it to better establish. Para 8.9 could also refer to the need for strategic landscaping/green infrastructure as part of masterplan proposals.	Amend para 8.9 to include reference to strategic landscaping/green infrastructure as part of masterplan proposals.